|  |  |
| --- | --- |
|  |  |

2013 Annual Project Review (APR)

Project Implementation Review (PIR) OF UNDP Supported GEF Financed Projects

PIMS 3523 - Project Title: Sustainable Transport

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Focal Area | Climate Change - Mitigation |
| Lead RTA |  Robert Kelly |
| Lead Country(ies) | (EGY) Egypt |
| Revised Planned Closing Date | 31-Dec-2014 |
| Overall Risk rating | Moderate |
| Overall DO rating | Moderately Satisfactory |
| Overall IP rating | Moderately Unsatisfactory |
| GEF grant amount disbursed so far | 1,633,657 |

Project Summary

The objective of the project is to create an enabling policy and institutional environment and to leverage financial resources for the sustainable transport sector development, including public-private partnerships, measured by the amount of financial resources leveraged for the first pilot projects, level of success in initiating their replication and the level of adoption of the required institutional changes and improvements in the general policy framework.

UNDP-GEF Technical Advisor’s Comments

Explanation for change to Overall DO Rating or Overall IP Rating:

The IP rating has been amended from MS to MU. While MS accurately captures the consensus stakeholder (Project Manager, CO, Implementing Partner) opinion, I, as RTA, feel that a Moderately Unsatisfactory rating is more appropriate. It is true that the project team has done a reasonable job of pushing the project forward in very difficult political circumstances, but the fact remains that, by any objective measure, project implementation progress is lagging - and has been lagging for over a year now. An MU rating will focus stakeholder attention on the project and allow the challenges to be circumvented or the project design to be adapted to the new (more challenging) circumstances.

Is this the terminal PIR that will serve as the final project report? No

If the mid-term review (MTR) OR the terminal evaluation (TE) was started but not completed this reporting period, please explain how these are progressing and note if any delays are expected:

The Mid-Term Review was finalised in February 2013.

The overall MTR rating for the project was Satisfactory.

The MTR summarises project performance as follows:

\"To date, the Project has yet to make an impact on GHG reductions. However, the Project is expected to generate direct emission reductions towards the end of the project through its involvement in implementing high-quality bus services from the western suburb cities to the Cairo University Metro Station, developing NMT infrastructure projects in Fayoum and Shebin El-Kom, improving traffic demand measures in Cairo city, and improving fuel efficiency in the freight transport sector. If these pilot investments can demonstrate sustained reductions in urban transport-related fuel consumption and energy intensity, indirect emission reductions are expected to increase based on the municipal governments and the private sector increasing their investments into improved public transport, NMT infrastructure and traffic demand measures. With 20-year cumulative GHG targets of 29.083 million tonnes CO2, all GHG targets should be reviewed, especially in concert with the recommended changes in this Evaluation Report.\"

The MTR assesses project sustainability as Moderately Likely (ML) mainly due to the completion of the approved Project pilot activities that include:

• New quality bus services to 6th October City, Sheikh Zayed and Dreamland;

• New quality bus services to integrate with two strategic metro stations in Cairo;

• NMT infrastructure in Fayoum and Shebin El-Kom;

• Parking VMSs in the central business district of Cairo;

• Mobile phone application for tracking and managing traffic on congested corridors;

• Transit signal priority corridor demonstration in Nasr City;

• Truck inspection stations to be operated by EEAA;

• Vehicular emission factor determination in urban areas;

The MTR concludes:

• Project delays have been a direct result of political instability and frequent changes of key Government ministers and personnel;

• During the periods of political instability between late 2010 and early 2012, the Project managed to utilize its time to complete tasks that did not require extensive involvement or approvals from Government officials;

• The current political climate appears supportive of the Project as the new Government has been clear on its intent to gradually remove fuel subsidies and to save as much energy as possible. This sets the stage for implementing sustainable transport pilots, recognized by Government as a high priority and as alternatives to mitigate the impact of reduced fuel subsidies as well as to improve urban mobility and environmental quality;

• There is concern that the Project will not achieve the target of demonstrating segregated bus lanes in Cairo. The importance of such lanes is important to demonstrating an improved quality of public transit (that competes with the private car as an urban transport mode), and facilitating a transport modal shift from private car owners towards public transit. Global experience indicates that bus services along corridors with priority signaling and without segregated lanes do not provide significant benefit-cost ratios. As such, the Project should at least pilot TDM measures with segregated bus lanes and monitor its effectiveness in reducing GHG emissions;

• The Project has adequate fiscal resources to achieve its targets; however, with the Project terminal date of December 31, 2013, there is insufficient time remaining to achieve these targets.

• Overall, the execution of this Project is not simple due to the wide spectrum of Government and non-governmental stakeholders involved, and the difficulties in reaching agreements with all of them. The PMU has performed well under these circumstances and the planning and design outputs from DRTPC are of high quality. The Project, however, will need to raise its profile through its website (www.stpegypt.org) and receive advice external to Egyptian expertise on how to achieve the Project objectives with the remaining resources.

The MTR makes the following recommendations:

Recommendation 1: The Project should retain its plans to demonstrate segregated bus lanes as a means of facilitating modal shifts from private cars to public transit. While there may be legitimate concerns that blocking off one lane for public transit may affect traffic flows, the Project needs to look at corridors where the impact of a segregated public transit lane can be successfully demonstrated. While it is understood that the concept of segregated bus lanes is not acceptable at this time to local authorities, the concept needs to remain on the Project agenda and be introduced during the remaining period of the Project. The advantage of demonstrating a segregated bus lane in Cairo through this Project will be to reduce bus travel times and improve the quality of public transit services significantly (to compete with the private car as an urban transit mode). Moreover, bus trip times will be similar length, if not longer, than normal traffic, affecting any competitive advantage public transit service may have over private car usage.

Recommendation 2: Improve the design of Output 3.2 by providing segregated lanes and increasing the length of the corridor with transit signal priority (TSP). The reason for seeking improvements to the current design is to improve the visibility of improved traffic flows and improve the likelihood of tangible GHG reduction benefits. Global experience of public transit companies on TSP corridors without segregated bus lanes indicates that there are, at best, marginal benefits to transit operators in the order of 6-15% reductions in trip time. When factoring in the high cost of installing and maintaining a TSP system, the benefit-cost analysis of TSP is low. During rush hours, when ridership is at its highest, there is a strong possibility that there are no benefits derived from TSP due to high traffic volumes that would affect the average speed of public transit vehicles. As such, the pilot design of Output 3.2, with 3 intersections without a segregated bus lane, may not demonstrate improvements to trip times that would encourage replication of the TSP network in Nasr City.

Recommendation 3: Continue with work to determine the emission factors for motor vehicles in terms of unit emissions per unit passenger-kilometer traveled. The current vehicle emission factors determined under Output 5.1 are for various car and taxi models expressed as kg emission per kg fuel consumed. To reflect improvements in transport energy efficiency, vehicle emission factors need to be normalized to reflect pollution loads in kilogram emissions per passenger-kilometre traveled. This will require additional work by the Project, including additional vehicle emission monitoring with differing load factors to reflect additional passengers, and conducting traffic counts with passengers. Hence, vehicles carrying additional passengers will be considered as being more efficient, a trend that the Project hopes to catalyze.

Recommendation 4: Approaches to estimating GHG reductions should align with GEF methods for calculating GHG reductions. GHG reductions generated by the Project should be estimated according to GEF’s “Manual for Calculating GHG Benefits of GEF Transportation Projects” and utilizing the Transportation Emissions Evaluations Models for Projects (TEEMP) .

Recommendation 5: The Project will require an extension of 24 months in its terminal date to late-2015 to allow the project sufficient time to achieve its objectives.

Recommendation 6: With the aforementioned recommendations, the Project should revise its log-frame targets as its monitoring towards completion of the Project in 2015.

Recommendation 7: Improve the dissemination and awareness of Project results. The Project needs to disseminate its cutting-edge work in sustainable transport to a wider spectrum of stakeholders. One means of dissemination is through the Project’s website (www.stpegypt.org) which was designed for this purpose but remains short of any information on sustainable transport improvements planned by the Project. Cutting-edge work by the Project, such as the vehicular emission factors for specific vehicles in Cairo and reports on truck energy efficiency, needs to be posted on the Project website to inform other mega-cities and the IPCC; as there are only a handful of cities globally that have had programs where actual measurements of vehicular emission factors have been conducted, the Project should make direct contact with the IPCC on the Project work on vehicular emission factors.

In its Management Response, the Country Office accepts the bulk of these recommendations. The notable exception is vis-a-vis bus lanes and whether the risks of implementing segregated bus lanes (in terms of disruption to existing traffic patterns) are too high.

The RTA agrees with the MTR recommendations and was consulted during the MTR preparation process.

No problems were encountered with the GEF Tracking Tool.

If the mid-term review (MTR) OR the terminal evaluation (TE) was completed this reporting period, or if this is the final APR/PIR, please address the following points here:

UNDP Country Office’s Comments

If the mid-term review (MTR) OR the terminal evaluation (TE) was started but not completed this reporting period, please explain how these are progressing and note if any delays are expected:

If the mid-term review (MTR) OR the terminal evaluation (TE) was completed this reporting period, or if this is the final APR/PIR, please address the following points here:

The project Mid-Term Evaluation was carried out in late 2012. The Independent Evaluator gave an overall Satisfactory (S) rating for the Project based on:

• Slow start-up of the project in 2009 where it took about 6 months due to lengthy and bureaucratic procedures for bidding and awarding of contracts for project consultants, engaging DRTPC to prepare a detailed five-year work plan for EST, obtaining approval of EEAA before finalizing the technical and budget distribution plans, and signing a protocol with DRTPC through its Transportation Programme as EST’s technical arm;

• Effective use of project resources and well-managed activities during the 2011-12 period of political instability and frequent changes of Government ministers;

• Additional efforts required by the PMU to adaptively manage the project during 2011-12;

• Adaptive management of a number of components that required the PMU to revise its outputs that has been carefully designed to continue assisting stakeholders in reducing transport-related GHG emissions;

• Buy-in of a number of Government stakeholders to well-designed pilots for high-quality bus services to satellite cities, NMT infrastructure for Fayoum, the transit signal priority (TSP) corridor and parking variable message signs (VMSs);

• Design of other pilots that have not yet been accepted by local and central Government authorities; this includes piloting of segregated bus lanes, parking measures and micro-pedestrian areas that will require additional efforts by the PMU and DRTPC for the remainder of the project to obtain commitments;

• Completion of a well-executed programme to determine car and taxi emission factors that best simulate urban driving conditions in Cairo, and useful inputs for EEAA in the formulation of sustainable transport policies; and

• The extensive efforts by the project to successfully engage a wide range of stakeholders for all project outcomes.

To date, the project has yet to make an impact on GHG reductions. However, the project is expected to generate direct emission reductions towards the end of the project through its involvement in implementing high-quality bus services from the western suburb cities to the Cairo University Metro Station, developing NMT infrastructure projects in Fayoum and Shebin El-Kom, improving traffic demand measures in Cairo city, and improving fuel efficiency in the freight transport sector. If these pilot investments can demonstrate sustained reductions in urban transport-related fuel consumption and energy intensity, indirect emission reductions are expected to increase based on the municipal governments and the private sector increasing their investments into improved public transport, NMT infrastructure and traffic demand measures. With 20-year cumulative GHG targets of 29.083 million tonnes CO2, all GHG targets should be reviewed, especially in concert with the recommended changes in this Evaluation Report.

Project sustainability rating is Moderately Likely (ML), mainly due to the completion of the approved project pilot activities. Replicability of the project activities depends on the outcome of the pilot activities:

• The design of the new high-quality bus service will be replicated if the pilot can demonstrate a good service to Cairo, can be operated with a rate of return of more than 15% with minimal Government subsidies, and if segregated lanes can be piloted to improve the service;

• The NMT designs will be replicated if pilots are well constructed and maintained, and if the quality of provincial city life improves to the extent that other cities will want to replicate these NMT projects;

• TDM measures such as the TSP corridor, VMS parking and mobile phone application for tracking and managing traffic on congested corridors. The TSP corridor as currently designed may not be replicated due to its lack of visible impact to traffic flows and the subsequent lack of acceptance by local Government authorities;

• For truck energy efficiency activities, there are insufficient activities to determine replicability.

Overall, the execution of this Project is not simple due to the wide spectrum of Government and non-governmental stakeholders involved, and the difficulties in reaching agreements with all of them. The PMU has performed well under these circumstances and the planning and design outputs from DRTPC are of high quality. The project, however, will need to raise its profile through its website (www.stpegypt.org) and receive advice external to Egyptian expertise on how to achieve the Project objectives with the remaining resources.

The Evaluator made 7 recommendations

Recommendation 1: The project should retain its plans to demonstrate segregated bus lanes as a means of facilitating modal shifts from private cars to public transit. While there may be legitimate concerns that blocking off one lane for public transit may affect traffic flows, the project needs to look at corridors where the impact of a segregated public transit lane can be successfully demonstrated. While it is understood that the concept of segregated bus lanes is not acceptable at this time to local authorities, the concept needs to remain on the project agenda and be introduced during the remaining period of the project. The advantage of demonstrating a segregated bus lane in Cairo through this project will be to reduce bus travel times and improve the quality of public transit services significantly (to compete with the private car as an urban transit mode). Moreover, bus trip times will be similar length, if not longer, than normal traffic, affecting any competitive advantage public transit service may have over private car usage.

Recommendation 2: Improve the design of Output 3.2 by providing segregated lanes and increasing the length of the corridor with transit signal priority (TSP). The reason for seeking improvements to the current design is to improve the visibility of improved traffic flows and improve the likelihood of tangible GHG reduction benefits. Global experience of public transit companies on TSP corridors without segregated bus lanes indicates that there are, at best, marginal benefits to transit operators in the order of 6-15% reductions in trip time.

Recommendation 3: Continue with work to determine the emission factors for motor vehicles in terms of unit emissions per unit passenger-kilometer traveled. The current vehicle emission factors determined under Output 5.1 are for various car and taxi models expressed as kg emission per kg fuel consumed.

Recommendation 4: Approaches to estimating GHG reductions should align with GEF methods for calculating GHG reductions. GHG reductions generated by the project should be estimated according to GEF’s “Manual for Calculating GHG Benefits of GEF Transportation Projects” and utilizing the Transportation Emissions Evaluations Models for Projects (TEEMP). The project should also provide a quality check of the GHG reductions generated from the TEEMP models by calculating GHG reductions through alternative means.

Recommendation 5: The project will require an extension of 24 months in its terminal date to late-2015 to allow the project sufficient time to achieve its objectives.

Recommendation 6: With the aforementioned recommendations, the project should revise its log-frame targets as its monitoring towards completion of the Project in 2015.

Recommendation 7: Improve the dissemination and awareness of project results. The project needs to disseminate its cutting-edge work in sustainable transport to a wider spectrum of stakeholders. One means of dissemination is through the project’s website (www.stpegypt.org) which was designed for this purpose but remains short of any information on sustainable transport improvements planned by the project. Cutting-edge work by the project, such as the vehicular emission factors for specific vehicles in Cairo and reports on truck energy efficiency, needs to be posted on the project website to inform other mega-cities and the IPCC; as there are only a handful of cities globally that have had programs where actual measurements of vehicular emission factors have been conducted, the project should make direct contact with the IPCC on the project work on vehicular emission factors

UNDP CO agrees to the evaluator’s findings but expresses concerns about the recommendation to use segregated bus lanes in the different applications without a thorough investigations to avoid any negative implications that discourage the replication of the pilots. Accordingly, it was recommended in the MTR management response to postpone implementation of the segregated bus lanes until after the successful implementation of the pilots and later on increase its efficiency by adding the segregated bus lane if investigations proves its practical feasibility. Meanwhile, the CO supports the request for a no-cost extension of the project for 24 months – 12 months of which have now been formally granted and an additional 12 months will be granted subject to project performance in the first 12 months of extension.

Dates of Project Steering Committee/Board meetings during reporting period:

March 2013

PROGRESS TOWARD DEVELOPMENT OBJECTIVES

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Description** | **Description of Indicator** | **Baseline Level** | **Target Level at end of project** | **Level at 30 June 2009** | **Level at 30 June 2010** | **Level at 30 June 2011** | **Level at 30 June 2012** | **Level at 30 June 2013** |
| To reduce the growth of energy consumption and related greenhouse gas emissions of the transport sector in Egypt, while simultaneously mitigating the local environmental and other problems of increasing traffic such as deteriorating urban air quality and congestion (Indicator: the growth rate of transport sector energy consumption). To create an enabling policy and institutional environment and leverage resources for sustainable transport sector development, including the increasing or sustained modal share of public and non-motorized transportation, reduced use of private cars and more energy efficient freight transportation. | The status and impact of the pilot projects. | The need for the proposed activities recognized, but the implementation suffering from different barriers. | The proposed pilot activities successfully concluded with the associated reduction of CO2 emissions by 1.48 million tonnes of CO2 equivalent (calculated for the pilot projects over 20 years from the project start) as a direct result of the project activities. |  | 1- The Project Steering Committee (PSC) established and 2 meetings held. 2- MoU signed between the Egyptian Environmental Affairs Agency and the Transportation Programme in the "Development Research and Technological Planning Center" of Cairo Univeristy for the latter to provide the required consultancy services and technical support for implementing the project activities. 3- The proposed pilot projects in Cairo Governorate presented to the Governor and his Advisors: discussions are ongoing with follow-up to secure approvals. 4- The proposed pilot projects in Fayoum Governorate presented to the Governor: discussions are ongoing with follow-up to secure approvals. 5- Following the announcement of the GEF approval to fund the project, the Agence Francaise De Developpment (AFD) approached UNDP highlighting interest in implementation of a project in the area of sustainable transport in Egypt. Accordingly, AFD has designed a sustainable transport project for Euro 1 million to complement the activities of the UNDP-GEF project and which uses the same UNDP-GEF management unit and project board to implement the French-funded project. | 1- Five proposed pilot projects have been presented to Cairo Governorate. The Governorate has approved the implementation of three projects, has requested to put on hold the fourth one for the timebeing, and to propose another location in Cairo for the application of the fifth project. Studies, surveys and design have started for 2 approved pilot projects. 2- Pilot project for connecting Greater Cairo with its satellite cities has been presented to the Ministry of Housing, Utilities and Urban Development , and 6 October Governorate. The project was approved and detailed studies, surveys and design have started. 3- Monofia Governorate approved the implementation of the proposed pilot project in Shebim El Kom City. Surveys and detailed design works are ongoing. 3- Fayoum Governorate approved the implementation of the proposed pilot project in Fayoum City. Surveys and detailed design works are ongoing. 4- The AFD and French GEF Project has been approved by the Governments of Egypt and France and the project activities and outputs were designed to ensure synargies with the UNDP-GEF Project | 1- Pilot project for connecting Greater Cairo with its satellite cities (6 October, Sheikh Zayed, and Media Production / Dreamland Cities) with integrated, high-quality public transportation has been approved by the Ministry of Transport and the Ministry of Housing, Utilities and Urban Development. Approvals have to be renewed due to changes in top officials following the political flux experienced in recent months in Egypt. Most of the detailed studies, surveys and designs have been completed. 2- All designs, specifications, and tender documents of the pilot project (non-motorised transport - NMT - corridor) in Shebin El Kom City in Monofia Governorate have been completed and approved. Three NGOs in Menofia Governorate have applied for grants from the GEF Small Grants Programme to complete the activities of the ESP. 4- Designs, specifications and tender documents of the pilot project (NMT corridors) in Fayoum City in Fayoum Governorate are almost complete. 5- Studies, surveys and part of the design for the 2 pilot projects involving bus priority systems at traffic signals and variable message signs for parking in Cairo city center have been conducted. 6- The activities of the AFD / French GEF Project "Support To An Improved Urban Transport System In Cairo"are being implemented in synergy with the UNDP-GEF Project under the same project management unit. The AFD project budget is one million Euros. | 1) A protocol for implementing the pilot project for connecting Greater Cairo with its satellite cities (6 October, Sheikh Zayed, and Media Production / Dreamland Cities) with integrated, high-quality public transportation has been signed between the Ministry of Transport, Ministry of Housing and Urban Development, Ministry of State for Environmental Affairs, and Giza Governorate after renewing their approvals. Arrangements for starting implementation of the pilot are ongoing, and the recruitment process for international consultants to review the completed design of the public transport bus services for the 5 new lines prepared by the project, and to support preparation of a concession contract between the bus operator and the New Urban Communities Agency (NUCA) for operating and maintaining the 5 new bus routes, has been initiated. Tendering for implementing the new lines is expected to take place in Q4 2013–Q1 2014.Estimated CO2 reductions from this pilot after 10 years will be about 120,000 tCO2. 2) The project secured a local contribution for implementing the pilot project of the non-motorized transport corridor in Fayoum City from the Egyptian Social Fund for Development, despite the existing difficult economic situation in the country. A Memorandum of Agreement was signed between a number of NGOs in the Governorates of Fayoum and Menfoia with the GEF Small Grants Programme to contribute to implementing the pilot project activities. The pilots are expected to be tendered for construction in Q4 2013. 3) Cairo Governorate approved implementation of 2 pilot projects for the bus priority system at traffic signals in a main corridor, and variable message parking signs (VMPS) in Cairo city centre. Tendering for the VMPS has proceeded, with installation and operation expected to be in Q4 2013–Q1 2014. Estimated CO2 reductions from this pilot after 10 years are about 2,000 tCO2. 4) A report on recommendations to improve national freight transport on road, rail and river was prepared and sent to the Ministry of Transport. Follow-up actions and results are expected in 2014. 5) Activities of the AFD / French GEF Project, \"Support To An Improved Urban Transport System In Cairo\", continue to be implemented in synergy with the UNDP-GEF project under the same project management unit. These activities include: a) Pilot project for improving Cairo Transit Authority El Nasr Garage to be a ”Green Garage” by improving the environmental performance (management and maintenance practices); b) conducting a “Study on estimation & modeling of factors governing emissions of CO2 and other air pollutants from the public transport Modes in Cairo\"; and c) conducting a “Study of the urban transport sector in Cairo to facilitate identification of the potential for GHGs emission reduction projects activities”. |
|  | Level of replication and/or expansion of the sustainable transport schemes promoted by the project |  | The replication of the projects initiated as per the stated replication targets, including the leveraging of financial resources for the amount of at least USD 100 million for their future implementation. |  | Discussions on replications will be opened after the implementation of the pilots | None of the pilot projects is finalized, and discussions on replication will start after that. | None of the pilot projects is finalized, and discussions on replication will start after finalization. Most of the surveys and design of the approved pilot project were completed and ready to be tendered for implementation but due to the Egyptian revolution on 25th January 2011 , and the interrupted period after it during 2011 / 2012, the following impacts have been felt: a) delayed decisions at the local authorities and the Government concerning the outputs of the project; b) delayed field technical activities; c) a need to renew approvals of the new top officials in Ministries, Governorates and Cities, as many of them have been changed, and sometimes change of the person in the same position took place more than once; and d) some impact on private sector stakeholders' plans. For replication, the project pilot approaches and success stories shall be documented, presented to the top management of the different stakeholders, and followed up as much as possible such that replication activities are inserted in their future plans. | None of the pilot projects is yet finalized: they are expected to be completed during 2014, and then discussions on replication will start. Approvals of the new top officials in Ministries and Governorates for the pilot project were renewed, most of the designs are completed, and some pilots are ready to be tendered for implementation. The existing economic situation still has some impact on private sector stakeholders\' plans. For replication, the project pilot approaches and success stories will be documented, presented to the top management of the different stakeholders, and followed up as much as possible such that replication activities are inserted in their future plans. |
|  | Level of adoption and implementation of the required policy and institutional changes |  | The required policy and institutional development needs recognized and implemented by the Government. |  | Dialogue on policy needs will be opened following the successful demonstrations of the pilots | None of the pilot projects is finalized. The dialogue on policy needs and institutional changes shall start after successful demonstration of the projects. | None of the pilot projects is finalized. The dialogue on policy needs and institutional changes for replication will start in parallel with the implementation of the pilot projects. | None of the pilot projects is yet finalized: implementation is planned to start during Q4 2013. The dialogue on policy needs and institutional changes for replication will start in parallel with the implementation of the pilot projects. |
| The concept for new, integrated high-quality public transport services (to exert shift from private cars) for Cairo and its satellite cities successfully introduced and replicated on the basis of public-private partnerships. | The new public transport services continue to operate on a self-sustaining basis at the end of the project | No adequate public transport services that can attract car users for the satellite cities available | The new public transport services introduced during the project continue to operate on a self-sustaining basis. |  | The proposed pilot projects (feeder bus for Saraya El Koba & Maadi metro stations) in Cairo Governorate were presented to Cairo Governor, his advisors, and the Traffic Engineering and Planning Department. The approvals and implementation details are currently under discussion. | 1- Concerning the proposed pilot project for executing a feeder bus system serving Saraya El Koba and Maadi metro stations, Cairo Governorate requested to put it on hold for the timebeing until after the results of the international tender launched by Cairo Governorate for privatizing public transportation services in some areas of Greater Cairo. 2- Pilot project for executing new, high-quality public transportation bus services connecting Greater Cairo with its satellite cities has been presented to the Ministry of Housing, Utilities and Urban Development, and 6 October Governorate. This project will connect 6 October City, Sheikh Zayed City, Media Production City & Dream Land to metro lines # 1 and # 2 in Greater Cairo, as well as a feeder bus line running within 6 October. The project was approved and the detailed studies, surveys and design have started and are near completion, including identification of land for bus depots and bus terminals, five bus routes were suggested and agreed upon with the authorities, preparation of layout maps, high and civil engineering design works, etc. The official allocation of land for the project was delayed because of the recent political events in Egypt; after the change of the Minister of Housing and senior officials in the Ministry, a new request for allocating the land has been submitted to the Ministry. Meanwhile, the agreement of the underground authority to integrate bus tickets with underground tickets has also been secured. | 1- The pilot project proposed earlier for executing a feeder bus public transportation system serving Saraya El Koba and Maadi metro stations is still on hold by Cairo Governorate. The international tender launched by Cairo Governorate for privatizing public transportation services in some areas of Greater Cairo was announced several times but no offers were received. The Government issued a Decree for establishing a new Agency for Regulating Urban Transport in Greater Cairo under the Ministry of Transport. The detailed mandate of the Agency still has to be issued before any other tenders are to be announced. 2- Concerning the pilot project for executing new, high-quality public transportation bus services connecting Greater Cairo with 6 October City, Sheikh Zayed City, Media Production City / Dream Land to metro line number 2 in Greater Cairo, as well as a feeder bus line running within 6 October (total of five bus routes), studies, field surveys, and design works (highway and civil engineering design works) are almost complete. The project has held several meetings with the Ministries of Environment, Transport and Housing and the pilot approval was renewed several times but Ministers and senior officials have changed several times since January 2011. Meanwhile, following the presidential elections completed in June 2012, a new government is to be established and the project will present the pilot project again to the new Ministers. | 1) The pilot project for executing a feeder bus public transportation system serving Saraya El Koba and Maadi metro stations is still on hold by Cairo Governorate until the new Agency for Regulating Urban Transport in Greater Cairo (which was recently established under the Ministry of Transport) becomes operational, and that is expected to be the end of 2013 or the beginning of 2014. The Agency mandate in relation to Cairo Transit Authority’s (CTA) mandate still has to be clarified before announcing tenders. 2) Pilot project for executing 3 new, high-quality public transportation bus services connecting Greater Cairo with 6th October City, Sheikh Zayed City, Media Production City / Dream Land to metro line number 2 in Greater Cairo, as well as two feeder bus lines running in 6 October: most of the studies, field surveys and design works (highway and civil engineering design works) have been completed. A protocol for implementing the project has been signed between the Ministry of Transport, the Ministry of Housing and Urban Development, the Ministry of State for Environmental Affairs, and Giza Governorate after renewing their approvals. The recruitment process has been initiated for international consultants to review the completed design of the public transport bus services for the 5 new lines prepared by the project, and to support preparation of a concession contract between the bus operator and the New Urban Communities Agency (NUCA) for operating and maintaining the 5 new bus routes. The new bus services are expected to be operating in Q2 2014. |
|  | Proposals and agreements for replication are submitted and negotiated with the relevant authorities | No feeder system that can attract car users for metro in place | Agreements for the replication of the concept of new, high quality and integrated (with cities’ internal public transport systems) inter-city bus services between Cairo and its 6 satellite cities formulated and discussed with the authorities |  | Activities will start after the successful implementation of the pilot | None of the pilot projects is finalized, and activities will start after the successful implementation of the pilots. | Agreements for replication of the concept of new, high quality and integrated bus services between Cairo and its satellite cities shall be formulated and discussed with the authorities in parallel with the implementation of the pilot projects, and after the new Government is in place. | Proposals and agreements for replicating the establishment of new, high quality and integrated public bus transportation services connecting Cairo with its satellite cities will be formulated and discussed with the authorities in parallel with the pilot project implementation during 2014. |
|  | The estimated amount of reduced GHG emissions by the pilot projects compared to the baseline | Lack of experience with more advanced, road-based public transport systems such as BRT. | Successful demonstration and agreement of the Government for replication of an integrated feeder bus and ticketing system for 9 existing and for 5 new metro stations in Cairo. |  | Activities will start after the successful implementation of the pilot | None of the pilot projects is finalized, and activities will start after the successful implementation of the pilots. | Demonstration and agreement with the Government for replication of integrated feeder bus and ticketing system for metro stations in Cairo shall start in parallel with the implementation of the pilot projects, and after the new Government is in place. | Demonstration and agreement with the Government for replication of integrated feeder bus and ticketing system for metro stations in Cairo will start in parallel with the pilot project implementation in 2014. Meanwhile, over the last year, the Ministry of Transport has unified the ticketing systems for three underground lines and shifted to contactless tickets which will be compatible with the bus tickets. |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| The modal share of non-motorized transport in middle-size provincial cities increased or sustained. | Modal share of NMT in the targeted cities | 52% in Shebin El-Kom (down from 68% in 1988) and 31% in Fayoum | The estimated current NMT modal share in the targeted cities sustained or increased |  | 1- The proposed non-motorized transport corridors (NMT) in Fayoum City were proposed to Fayoum Governor, and are currently under discussion. 2- The proposed NMT corridors in Shebin El Kom City are currently under investigation. | 1. Governor of Fayoum has sent an official approval for the implementation of the proposed pilot project for constructing non-motorized transport corridors for walking and cycling in Fayoum City. However, the Governor was changed in March and the project was reintroduced to the new Governor who has confirmed the approval to implement the project 2- Governorate of Monofia has approved the proposed pilot project for constructing non-motorized transport corridors for walking and cycling in Shebin El Kom City. Given that the Governor of Monofia was also changed, the proposal was presented to the new Governor, who has expressed even greater support to the project 3. Agreements were made with the GEF Small Grants Programme and El-Sawy Cultural Center to provide additional funds to support a number of NGOs in national awareness campaigns to promote cycling and to facilitate purchase of bicycles on an installment payment basis in the two governorates and to mobolize resources from the private sector to co-fund construction. | In Menfoia, the Governor has approved the design for non-motorized transport corridors for walking and cycling in Shebin El Kom City. The new Governor has provided significant personal support to the project during the design phase, and the tendering process is about to be initiated. Meanwhile, the Governor of Menofia is working with the project in mobilizing the co-funding for the pilot implementation from CSR budgets of private sector companies as per the agreement in the Project Document. Links have been established between the project and the GEF SGP in Egypt to engage local NGOs in the implementation of the project. Meanwhile the links with El-Sawy Cultural Center will continue to promote awareness on benefits of cycling and walking. In Fayoum, the Governor was changed again in August 2011 and the pilot project for constructing non-motorized transport corridors for walking and cycling in Fayoum City was reintroduced to the new Governor, who has approved proceeding with implementation and has promised to provide all required support. Results of discussions with the senior officials in the Governorates are good indicator for the PMU that the pilot NMT corridors are regarded as an urban development initiative that supports behavioural change and accordingly it is envisaged that it will enable the project to achieve its target for sustaining / increasing the modal share of NMT. | For Menofia and Fayoum Governorates, all designs and tender documents for non-motorized transport corridors for walking and cycling in Shebin El Kom and Fayoum Cities respectively have been completed and approved by the local authorities and are ready for tendering. During this reporting period, the Governor of Menofia has again been replaced (twice in fact), and the Governor of Fayoum changed once. The project made considerable efforts to mobilize co-funding for the pilot implementations from the CSR budgets of private sector companies, but it became difficult due to the deteriorating economic situation in the country. The Social Fund for Development (SFD) was approached by the project to assist in financing the pilot project implementation in the two Governorates. Ultimately, a protocol was signed between Fayoum Governorate and SFD for co-funding the pilot in Fayoum City with LE 2 millions (approximately US$286,000) while the total estimated cost of the pilot is LE 4 million. The project coordinated with the GEF Small Grants Programme (SGP) in Egypt to catalyze the participation of local NGOs in implementing pilot project activities in Menofia and Fayoum Governorates. The project organized awareness and consultation seminars with the participation of Menofia and Fayoum NGOs. Two NGOs from Menofia - the Egyptian Association for the Advancement of Women & Children, and El Taqua Association - obtained funds from GEF SGP for implementing some of the project activities as awareness campaigns, establishment of bicycle parking racks and revolving funds for supporting bicycle purchases. Two other NGOs in Fayoum - the Arab Association for Human Development and Community Service, and Al-Ber and El-Khadamat El-Islamia Association - are about to obtain funding. The total of GEF SGP grants is approximately $200,000. Results achieved to date are a good indicator for the PMU that the pilot NMT corridors are regarded as an urban development initiative that supports behavioral change; accordingly, it is envisaged that the corridors will enable the project, by 2014/2015, to achieve its target for sustaining / increasing the modal share of NMT. |
|  | Number of kilometres of new NMT corridors constructed and used |  | A total of 50km of new NMT corridors constructed and used by the end of the project |  | NMT corridor in Fayoum: 1-Field visits, preliminary design, and preliminary updated cost of construction. 2- Documents and presentations prepared for decision makers. 4- Presentation of the proposed pilot projects to Fayoum Governor, discussions, and follow-up to secure approvals. NMT corridor in Shebin El-Kom: 1- Field visits, preliminary design, and preliminary updated cost of construction. 2- Documents and presentations prepared to secure approval. | 1- Non-motorized transport corridors for walking and cycling in Fayoum City and Shebin El Kom City: conceptual designs and topographic surveys were completed in full coordination with the Governorate. Corridors and bicycle parking locations were selected and approved. Currently, work is ongoing on the detailed civil highways and traffic engineering design and architectural design, which are near completion for both cycling tracks. | In Menfoia Governorate, detailed designs, specifications and tendering documents for non-motorized transport corridors for walking and cycling in Shebin El Kom City have been completed in full coordination with the Governorate officials and approved by Monofia Governorate. The tendering for construction is about to be announced. The length of the corridor is about 16 km both ways. I t is expected that construction of Monofia pilot project will start in October 2012, and that it will be fully operational in May 2013 . In Fayoum Governorate, non-motorized transport corridors for walking and cycling in Fayoum City: studies, surveys, and detailed designs (civil "Highways" and "Traffic" engineering designs and site planning works) have been conducted in full coordination with Governorate officials. Specifications and tender documents are almost finalized. Documents will be presented to the Governor for approval before tendering construction.The length of the corridor is about 12 km both ways. I t is expected to start construction of Fayoum pilot project in December 2012, and for it to be fully operational in July 2013 . | In Menofia and Fayoum Governorates, all designs and tendering documents for non-motorized transport corridors for walking and cycling in Shebin El Kom and Fayoum Cities have been completed in full coordination with Governorate officials and approved by them. The total length of the corridors is about 28 km. Construction of the Fayoum pilot project is expected to start in Q3 2013, and to be fully operational in July 2014. Construction of the Menofia pilot project is expected to start at the end of 2013, and to be fully operational in September 2014. |
|  | The estimated amount of reduced GHG emissions by the selected pilot projects compared to the baseline. |  | Reduced CO2 emissions of 0.26 million tons of CO2 equivalent (calculated for the pilot projects over 20 years from the project start) as a direct result of the project activities |  | Activities will start after the successful implementation of the pilot | None of the pilot projects is finalized, and activities will start after the successful implementation of the pilots. | CO2 emissions to be reduced as direct result of the project activities shall be estimated once designs are finalized and approved, in parallel with the implementation of the pilot projects. | The CO2 emissions to be reduced as a direct result of the project activities will be estimated in parallel with the implementation of the pilot projects that will start in Q4 2013. The CO2 emission reductions have not yet been achieved and the future expected reductions will be known within 6 months of the operation of the NMT corridors. |
| Successful introduction of the Transport Demand Management (TDM) concept with an objective to expand it towards more aggressive measures over time to effectively discourage the use of private cars, when good quality public transport services are available. | The level of enforcement of the piloted TDM measures | No real strategy currently in place to effectively proceed with TDM in order to reduce local air pollution and congestion in Greater Cairo area and Alexandria and simultaneously contribute to GHG reduction | The pilot TDM measures effectively enforced and respected by car users |  | The proposed pilot projects (1- bus priority system at traffic signals in Moustafa El Nahas corridor and; 2- micro pedestrian zones at El Genena & El Serag Malls) in Cairo Governorate were presented to Cairo Governor, his advisors, and the Traffic Engineering and Planning Department. The approvals and implementation details are currently under discussion. | 1- Cairo Governorate approved the implementation of the following two TDM pilot projects: a) applying a bus priority system at traffic signals in Moustafa El Nahas Corridor; b) introducing variable message parking signs to guide cars to the appropriate parking facilities around the city centre. 2- Concerning the pilot project for constructing micro pedestrian zones, the Traffic Engineering and Planning Department in Cairo Governorate rejected the two proposed locations at El Genena and El Serag Malls, and requested the project to propose alternatives. | 1- New Cairo Governor confirmed approval for implementation of the two TDM pilot projects: a) applying a bus priority system at traffic signals in Moustafa El Nahas Corridor; b) introducing variable message parking signs to guide cars to the appropriate parking facilities around the city centre. Detailed studies, surveys and most of the design work were completed by the project local experts. Results shall be presented to Cairo Governorate for approval before launching RFP for International Companies to provide detailed design, supply and installation of the systems. 2- Concerning the pilot project for constructing micro pedestrian zones, the Minister of State for Environmental Affairs requested to hold it for the time being, as Cairo Governorate also had comments on the locations proposed earlier by the project experts. The proposal will be submitted again to the new government following the presidential election | The Governor of Cairo was changed (again) in August 2012. After coordination and meetings with the new Governor, he confirmed approval for implementation of the two TDM pilot projects: a) applying a bus priority system at traffic signals in Moustafa El Nahas Corridor; and b) introducing variable message parking signs to guide cars to the appropriate parking facilities around the city centre. An RFP for international companies to provide design, supply, installation and maintenance of the system for introducing variable message parking signs to guide cars to the appropriate parking facilities around the city centre has been launched and proposals received. Implementation is expected to start in Q4 2013. An RFP for international companies to provide design, supply, installation and maintenance of the system for introducing public transport bus priority system at traffic signals in Moustafa El Nahas Corridor has been prepared, approved by Cairo Governorate, and is ready to be launched. Cairo Governorate is studying the integration of that system with another project under design by Cairo Governorate for developing the Moustafa El Nahas Corridor. |
|  | The level of satisfaction of the key stakeholders on the effectiveness of the TDM measures introduced |  | High satisfaction of the key stakeholders on the effectiveness of the TDM measures introduced and on the quality of the alternative public transport services provided |  | The proposed pilot projects were presented to Cairo Governor, his advisors, and the Traffic Engineering and Planning Department. There is political will and support for the project. | There is strong political support from Cairo Governorate for the proposed TDM pilot projects concerning the bus priority system at traffic signals, and variable message parking signs. | Approval of the TDM pilot projects concerning the bus priority system at traffic signals, and variable message parking signs has be renewed from the new Cairo Governorate. Full design will be presented to the Governor of Cairo for approval before initating the tendering process | Cairo Governorate approved the two TDM pilot projects: a) the public transport bus priority system at traffic signals in Moustafa El Nahas corridor; and b) the variable message parking signs in the city center. The tendering process has been initiated for the variable message parking signs in the city center, and will be initiated for the public transport bus priority system at traffic signals after Cairo Governorate integrate their project for developing Mostafa El Nahas corridor, which is likely to be finalized by the end of Q3 2013. |
|  | The estimated amount of reduced GHG emissions by the selected pilot projects compared to the baseline |  | Agreement of the local governments to replicate and/or expand the pilot TDM measures in the Greater Cairo Area and, if applicable, Alexandria |  | Activities will start after the successful implementation of the pilot | None of the pilot projects is finalized, and activities will start after the successful implementation of the pilots. | None of the pilot projects is finalized and activities will start after the successful implementation of the pilots | The pilot projects are not finalized yet, and activities will start after the successful implementation of the pilots. |
| Improved energy efficiency of freight transport | Fuel consumption and the associated GHG emissions per ton and km of goods transported | Inefficient operation of the existing truck fleet | Reduced CO2 emissions of 0.85 million tons of CO2 equivalent (calculated for the pilot projects over 20 years from the project start) as a direct result of the project activities |  | Cooperation is ongoing between the Egyptian Environmental Affairs Agency (EEAA) and the Ministry of Interior Affairs for establishing vehicle integrated environmental and technical inspection stations. A feasibility study has been conducted, and includes evaluation of the existing inspection system, identification of drawbacks and areas for improvements, development of improved vehicles emissions testing VET system. The MoI is planning to tender the establishment and potentially also the operation of vehicle integrated environmental and technical inspection stations to the private sector | 1-1- Due to the interrupted period after the revolution in Egypt on 25 January 2011, the Ministry of Interior has suspended the tendering process for the establishment of the vehicle-integrated centres for technical and environmental inspection. 2- Cairo Governorate has approved the idea of a pilot project to support development of freight intermodal terminal facilities using modern information technologies. 3- A study is being prepared for updating the situation analysis of freight transport in Egypt, and policy recommendations for efficient urban freight transport | 1. Several high-level meetings and official communications were exchanged between EEAA and Ministry of Interior (MoI) to establish one integrated station for vehicle environmental and technical inspection in Greater Cairo as a pilot project. In principle, MoI is committed to the establishment of the station but, with the political instability in the country, the pilot project has been put on hold for the moment. Implementing the station is expected to start in November 2012. 2. Governors of Cairo and Menofia have approved implementing pilot projects to support development of freight intermodal terminal facilities using modern information technologies and investigations are ongoing to select appropriate locations. | 1) The Egyptian Environmental Affairs Agency (EEAA) and the Ministry of Interior (MoI) have agreed to establish one integrated station for vehicle environmental and technical inspection in Greater Cairo as a pilot project. MoI is committed to the establishment of the station but, due to the political instability in the country, the pilot project has been put on hold for the moment. Implementation of the station is expected to start in 2014. 2) A report on recommendations (excluding those relating to infrastructure) in previous transport studies from 2000-2012 to improve national freight transport on road, rail and river has been prepared and sent to the Minister of Transport for further discussion with the project team on sustainable transport priority measures that can be supported by the project. 3) Concerning the pilot project for development of a freight inter-modal terminal facility using modern information technologies, several investigations were conducted in selected urban areas to verify the existing situation of truck inter-modal terminals, and to select the appropriate one for improvement. However, it was found that the case reported in the 2005 preparatory phase of the project concerning the development / reallocation of Nasr City informal truck terminal was a specific case that is not repeated elsewhere in the country. That case created significant environmental problems and raised serious concerns at the time, but this problem currently does not exist any more in Nasr City as the informal terminal has been replaced with a formal one in Badr City outside of Cairo. Consequently, this activity has stopped. Nevertheless, the project is still investigating possible complementary interventions in this area. |
|  | Fuel consumption and the associated GHG emissions per ton and km of goods transported | Low utilization of the available rail and river based freight transport options | Over 100,000 tons savings in fuel consumption as a result of the project activities by the end of the project. |  | Activities are scheduled to start in 2011/2012 | None of the pilot projects has yet been finalized. | 1. A study on updating the situation analysis and developing policy recommendations for improving the energy efficiency of urban freight transport in Egypt has been prepared. 2. A study on the typology of "Policies and projects recommended to improve national freight transport on road, rail and river in Egypt" has been prepared. | A report on recommendations (excluding those relating to infrastructure) to improve national freight transport on road, rail and river has been finalized, and sent to the Minister of Transportation. This will be followed by discussions on the appropriate sustainable transport measures to be adopted by the Ministry of Transport and supported by the project. |
| Strengthened institutional capacity to promote sustainable transport sector development during and after the project. | The progress with the institutional reforms and other improvements needed | The level of awareness and capacity of the key stakeholders as well as the level of adoption and implementation of the required legal, regulatory and institutional changes to facilitate sustainable transport sector development still low | For all outcomes: Adoption of a national, sustainable transport policy addressing the key requirements and setting concrete short, medium and long term targets in different key areas the project is addressing |  | Coordination is ongoing between EEAA and the Ministry of Interior Affairs in conducting a baseline field study for determining the emission factors of private cars and small taxis under local driving conditions using on-board emissions measuring equipment and traffic surveys data for selective areas in Greater Cairo representing various land use types | The field study for determination of the emission factors of private cars and taxis with gasoline engines under local driving conditions in Greater Cairo has been initiated using on-board measuring equipment. A comprehensive survey and analysis of the existing cars in Greater Cairo was carried out prior to the field study to identify representative samples in terms of vehicle age, engine capacity, etc. Ten loops were also designed that represent various local driving conditions. Test measurements have been conducted on several types of vehicles, and the data have been quality-assured and analyzed. The ongoing full programme will cover about 100 cars. | The field study for determination of fuel based emission factors of private cars and taxis with gasoline engines under local driving conditions in Greater Cairo using on-board measuring equipment has nearly been finalized. Meanwhile the AFD/French GEF project, which is being coordinated by the UNDP-GEF PMU, is appointing an international consulting firm to conduct a similar exercise for diesel engine vehicles (buses, minibuses & microbuses) in Greater Cairo that will complement the activities of the GEF project. The studies shall help in preparing a vehicle emissions inventory, calculating fuel consumption and fuel subsidies savings, which are important inputs for the preparation of a national sustainable transport policy . | The field study and final report on determination of fuel-based emission factors of private cars and taxis with gasoline engines under local driving conditions in Greater Cairo using on-board measuring equipment have been completed. The AFD / French GEF project (also managed by the GEF Project Management Unit) started conducting a complementary field study for determination of fuel-based emission factors of diesel engine vehicles (buses, minibuses and microbuses) under local driving conditions in Greater Cairo using on-board measuring equipment. |
|  |  |  | For Outcome 1: Enhanced capacity of the Ministry of Transport and its underlying agencies in the area of sustainable transport to effectively co-ordinate the development of the public transport systems in Cairo and other major urban centers in Egypt. |  | Activities are scheduled to start in 2011/2012 | Discussions and arrangements are ongoing with the local authorities and Cairo Transit Authority, but activities are not yet implemented. | Ministerial Decree # 2276 was issued on 15 August 2010 to establish a new Agency for Regulating / Coordinating Urban Transport in Greater Cairo, under the Ministry of Transport. The Decree was kept on hold after the Egyptian revolution on 25 January 2011 until March 2012, when the Ministry of Transport started to activate the Decree. The mandate of the new Agency is still under discussion and the project is investigating opportunities to assist in institutional setup and capacity building. | With reference to the Ministerial Decree # 2276 issued on 15 August 2010, a Presidential Decree # 349 for year 2012 was issued on 6 November 2012 to establish the new Agency for Regulating Transport in Greater Cairo, under the Ministry of Transport. The new Agency is under establishment, and its mandate and organization are still being developed. The project has been investigating opportunities to assist in institutional set-up and capacity building of the new Agency, but as this entity is not yet operational it was agreed to instead enhance the capacity of the Ministry of Transport and its underlying agencies (river, rail authorities and the General Authority for Roads, Bridges and Land Transport GARBLT) in the area of sustainable transport to effectively co-ordinate the development of the public transport systems in Cairo and other major urban centers in Egypt. |
|  |  |  | For Outcome 2: The non-motorized transport (NMT) modal share in Fayoum and Shebin El Kom cities sustained or increased, and the capacity of the local authorities in the 2 Governorates enhanced to develop and implement NMT. Social acceptance of cycling, and NMT supply side services in the 2 cities increased. |  | Activities are scheduled to start in 2011/2012 | Implementation of the pilot projects in Fayoum and Shebin El Kom cities has started but not yet finalized. | In Shebin El Kom City, it is expected to start construction of the non-motorized corridor for pedestrians and cycling pilot project in October 2012, and to be fully operational in May 2013 . In Fayoum City, it is expected to start construction in December 2012, and to be fully operational in July 2013 . The successful implementation of these pilot projects shall encourage the local authorities in Monofia and Fayoum Governorates to replicate them in other provincinal cities. It will also help in increasing the social acceptance of cycling, and supply of side services such as trade, maintenance and repair of bicycles, which will all lead to the increase of the NMT modal share in the 2 Governorates. | The project has cooperated with the Embassy of the Kingdom of the Netherlands for the purpose of encouraging cycling. The Project Manager and part of the project technical team participated in an awareness seminar about cycling organized by the Embassy of the Kingdom of the Netherlands and the Netherlands-Flemish Institute in Cairo in cooperation with the Green Arm of Nahdat El-Mahrousa NGO. Dutch and Egyptian experts discussed opportunities for cycling in Egypt as a means of transport, and the Project Manager made a presentation about the pilot project for constructing non-motorized corridor for cycling and pedestrians in Fayoum and Menofia Cities. Joint efforts have also been undertaken between the project and the Dutch for arranging for implementation of the awareness component of the pilot. In Fayoum City, it is expected to start construction of the non-motorized corridor for pedestrians and cycling pilot project in Q3 2013, and for it to be fully operational in July 2014. In Shebin El Kom City, construction is expected to start by the end of 2013, and to be fully operational in September 2014. Successful implementation of these pilot projects will encourage the local authorities in the two Governorates to replicate them in other provincial cities. It will also help in increasing the social acceptance of cycling, and supply of side services such as trade, maintenance and repair of bicycles, which will all lead to an increase of the NMT modal share in the two Governorates. |
|  |  |  | For Outcome 3: Subject to the agreement with the local authorities, a semi-public parking authority to implement and, in close collaboration with other key authorities, to enforce parking policies (conducive to sustainable transport sector development principles), if possible, established by the end of the project and its capacity built. |  | Activities are scheduled to start in 2011/2012 | Cairo Governorate has welcomed the support to be provided by the project for establishing a semi-public Parking Authority to enforce parking policies, and the restructering of parking fees in the city centre. These activities are scheduled to start in 2012. | Cairo Governorate welcomed the support to be provided by the project for establishing a semi-public Parking Authority to enforce parking policies, and the restructuring of parking fees in the city centre. Due to the existing political uncertainty in the country, these activities have been shifted to 2013. | After the Revolution on 25 January 2011, and due to the existing political uncertainty in the country, it has become extremely difficult to set up new institutional and regulatory frameworks for parking policies in Cairo’s Central Business District (CBD). That was discussed with the Evaluator in the Mid-Term Review, and it was agreed to cancel this output. |
|  |  |  | For Outcome 4: Enhanced capacity of the Ministry of Transport and its underlying agencies to develop and implement sustainable transport policies and actions in the field of freight transport |  | Activities are scheduled to start in 2011/2012 | Activities have not yet started, but are scheduled to start in 2012. | The project has started preparing training courses to introduce the concept of "sustainable transport" in 25 cities in Egypt, for enhancing the capacity of the Ministry of Transport and its underlying agencies to develop and implement sustainable transport policies and actions. Implementation is scheduled to start in the second half of 2012. | The project has been preparing a training programme for local authority engineers in the main cities on building the local capacity for integrated urban land use and transport planning in the area of sustainable passenger transport and sustainable freight transport. Site visits for selected cities were conducted to determine the problems of land use / transport interaction in these cities. The training programme is scheduled to start in the first half of 2014. |
| Monitoring, learning, adaptive feedback and evaluation | The required information available for adaptive management, for measuring the impact and for effective replication/expansion of the project activities | Inadequate information for adaptive management, for measuring the impact and for effective replication/expansion of the project activities | The required information available for adaptive management, for measuring the impact of the project and for effective replication/expansion of the project activities |  | Change of the context of application compared to 2005 when the original project document was prepared required adaption of the project management. An example of the changes undertaken 1- New initiative of Cairo Governorate to lease about one-third of the public bus lines to 4 private companies (winners in international tender) dictate that Outcome # 1 pilots should fit under this initiative without affecting the proposed design standards and the requirements of the level of service of the new bus lines of this Outcome as per the Project Document; 2- Fayoum authorities did not agree to perform any construction works in 2010 on the street segments of the 2005 proposed cycling network to establish segregated cycling track on those segments, as they have been rehabilitated very recently. There is also the threat of mushrooming motor cycle purchase as competition to bicycles in that city which was not the case in 2005 when the project document was prepared. Example of the project management adaptations to deal with these changes are as follows: 1- Investigate and conduct surveys to explore the actual situation, developments that have occurred and changes initiated since 2005. 2- Update information /data; and 3- Make the required adjustments, as for example: a) Concerning Cairo Governorate, the project is trying to arrange that the new public bus feeder under Outcome # 1 to be operated by the winner in the international tender made by the Governorate. b) In Fayoum Governorate, the possibility of focusing project activities in Fayoum City on bicycle parking near universities, schools and work places and on boosting the purchase of bicycles with innovative financing mechanisms. | 1- The project management adaption strategy has succeeded to a large extent to respond to the changes in the national context compared to 2005 when the project was designed. 2- In response to the work interruptions and change s of senior government officials (including Ministers and Governors) in 2011, the project has pursued an adaptive management strategy to initiate the desk studies necessary for initiating the freight component which were planned late in 2011. | Over the past year, most of the senior officials the project has been liaising with, including Ministers in key Government partner agencies, have changed several times. The political instability has materially affected the political decision-making process, which has delayed implementation decisions for several pilots. In response, the project has pursued an adaptive strategy through an adjusted workplan for 2011 / 2012, concentrating on carrying out the feasible field work and otherwise focusing on office work (technical studies, design of training courses, etc.) until the Government is in a better position to take implementation decisions after the presidential elections (June 2012). | During the past year, almost all of the field and office works for the pilot projects have been ready, and the project management worked hard on renewing the approvals of new Government officials (as many of the Ministers and Governors the project had initially been liaising with have subsequently changed, in some cases several times). A protocol for implementing Component # 1 pilot project was signed between the involved stakeholders, and arrangements were undertaken to start implementing the different pilots under other Components. The continuation of political instability has affected the political decision-making process, which has delayed implementation decisions. In response, the project has pursued an adaptive strategy through an adjusted workplan for 2012 / 2013, in which efforts were concentrated on completing field and office works, and to prioritize the pilot projects in the Governorates and under the Ministries that are relatively more stable politically and showing more flexibility. |

RATINGS OF PROGRESS TOWARD MEETING DEVELOPMENT OBJECTIVES

|  |
| --- |
| DO Rating: Please review the Development Objective Progress page of this APR/PIR and then answer the questions below. A DO rating will be generated based on your answers. |
| 1 Please rate the cumulative progress being made toward achieving the end-of-project targets as reported in the project results framework in the DO page of this APR/PIR |
| 2 Please rate the likelihood that the project will deliver environmental and social benefits for an extended period after project completion? |
| 3 Please rate the likelihood that social or political risks may threaten the sustainability of project outcomes |
| **Project Manager/Coordinator: Is the person managing the day to day operations of the project.** |
| MANDATORY RATING MUST BE PROVIDED for projects under implementation in one country or regional projects where appropriate. |
| Please justify your rating and address the following points in your comments. Please keep word count between 500 words minimum and 1200 words maximum. |
| 1. | Explain why you gave a specific rating. |
| 2. | Note trends, both positive and negative, in achievement of outcomes as per the updated indicators provided in the DO sheet. |
| 3. | Fully explain the critical risks that have affected progress. |
| 4. | Outline action plan to address projects with DO rating of HU, U or MU. |
| Overall 2009 Rating  |  |
| Overall 2010 Rating  | Satisfactory |
| Overall 2011 Rating  | Highly Satisfactory |
| Overall 2012 Rating  | Satisfactory |
| 2013 Rating | Satisfactory |
| Comments | The project is given a Satisfactory rating for 2013, as it is moving on the right track toward achieving its development objectives, and the project’s components have been progressing well according to the project workplan for 2012 / 2013. The project development achievements in this reporting period have included: - Outcome # 1: design of a pilot project for executing new, high-quality integrated public transportation bus services connecting 6 October, Sheikh Zayed and Media Production Cities with the Metro in Greater Cairo, and 2 feeder bus lines in 6 October City are nearly finalized. - Outcome # 2: tender documents for 2 Pilot projects for constructing non-motorized transport corridors in Monofia and Fayoum Governorates have been completed and approved, and the project is ready for initiating tendering with the financial participation of the Social Fund For Development. Outcome # 3: a) RFP for design, supply and installation of a pilot project for applying a bus priority system at traffic signals in Mostafa El Nahas Corridor is ready to be launched; and b) an RFP for design, supply and installation of a pilot project for introducing variable message parking signs to guide cars to parking facilities around Cairo city centre has been launched, and proposals received. Outcome # 4: EEAA and Ministry of Interior agreed to implement a pilot project for establishing an integrated environmental and technical inspection center for vehicles in Greater Cairo. Outcome # 5: The field work and final report for determination of emission factors of gasoline private cars/taxis under local driving conditions in Greater Cairo using on-board measuring equipment have been finalized. The PMU continued supervising \"Support to an Improved Urban Transport System in Cairo Project\", funded by French GEF/AFD, and coordinating the activities between the two projects. AFD Project activities complement those of the GEF/UNDP project. There are very good opportunities to implement the pilot projects successfully, as their objectives are fully integrated with the Government\\\'s future strategies and plans. |
| **UNDP Country Office Programme Officer: Is the UNDP programme officer in the UNDP country office who provides oversight and supervision support to the project.** |
| MANDATORY RATING MUST BE PROVIDED for projects under implementation in one country. Not necessary for regional or global projects.  |
| Please justify your rating and address the following points in your comments. Please keep word count between 500 words minimum and 1200 words maximum.  |
| 1. | Explain why you gave a specific rating, for example, if your rating differs from the rating provided by the project manager please explain why. |
| 2. | Note trends, both positive and negative, in achievement of outcomes as per the updated indicators provided in the DO sheet. |
| 3. | Fully explain the critical risks that have affected progress.  |
| 4. | Outline action plan to address projects with DO rating of HU, U or MU.  |
| Overall 2009 Rating  |  |
| Overall 2010 Rating  | (S) Satisfactory |
| Overall 2011 Rating  | (S) Satisfactory |
| Overall 2012 Rating  | (MS) Moderately Satisfactory |
| 2013 Rating | (MS) Moderately Satisfactory |
| Comments | Despite the ongoing political developments in Egypt, the project team meetings with the newly-appointed senior government officials confirmed that the project objectives still meets current national development priorities. The same finding was re-iterated in the Steering Committee meeting that included the project stakeholders. Furthermore, the Minister of Housing made an offer to the project to sign a protocol among key government players involved in the implementation of the pilot project related to high-quality bus services in order to avoid future disturbances resulting from the frequent change in senior government positions during the extended transitional period. The signature of the protocol between the parties, as explained in the IP Section, emphasizes the government\'s commitment to the project objectives. Meanwhile, the project team has also arranged for meetings with private sector members of the American Chamber of Commerce who expressed an interest in investing in the bus projects once they are tendered. The Project Management Unit (PMU) has also been coordinating project activities with the FEEM project that include some synergized activities with the GEF-UNDP project and that is managed by the same PMU. Furthermore the project has been an active member in the EU led forum for International Agencies working in the area of transport to ensure coordination and synergies among these initiatives. Another important positive development that took place during this reporting year was securing the 50% co-funding for establishment of the cycling tracks in Fayoum City. It was originally planned to have the co-funding from CSR budgets from private sector companies under the UN Global Compact but, given the current economic slowdown in Egypt, the companies highlighted that financial difficulties would not allow them to contribute to the project. In response, the UNDP CO explored alternative sources through one of the UNDP joint projects with the Social Fund for Development (SFD) funded from the World Bank for labour-intensive public works projects. The SFD expressed interest to join the GEF project and the PMU pursued the lengthy application process until the agreement was finally signed between the Governorate of Fayoum and SFD, and the tender for Fayoum City is about to be announced. As for Shebin El-Kom City, the Monofia Governorate is working on upgrading the infrastructure of the city and agreed to implement the project design while paving the roads, thus providing the needed co-funding for implementing the pilot project. Details of implementation are currently under discussion between the PMU and the Governorate to explore modalities for implementation. Furthermore, the PMU has facilitated and supported two NGOs to apply to the GEF SGP to obtain funds to contribute to the implementation of the pilot projects. The Dutch Development Agency has been in contact with the project over the last year and has offered to establish links between the project and the Dutch Cycling Embassy to share experience from other countries and contribute to the awareness campaigns on the cycling benefits. The project is making steady progress towards its development objectives, though it has been hampered by the complexity (and multiple involved stakeholders) of the demonstration projects and by the political uncertainty in the country. A Moderately Satisfactory DO rating is warranted. |
| **Project Implementing Partner: Is the representative of the executing agency (in GEF terminology). This would be Government (for NEX/NIM execution) or NGO (for CSO Execution) or an official from the Executing Agency (for example UNOPS).**  |
| RECOMMENDED but NOT MANDATORY for projects under implementation in one country and regional projects.  |
| Please justify your rating and address the following points in your comments. Please keep word count between 200 words minimum and 500 words maximum.  |
| 1. | Explain why you gave a specific rating. |
| 2. | Note trends, both positive and negative, in achievement of outcomes as per the updated indicators provided in the DO sheet. |
| 3. | Provide recommendations for next steps. |
| **Project Implementing Partner** |
| Overall 2009 Rating  |  |
| Overall 2010 Rating  |  |
| Overall 2011 Rating  | (HS) Highly Satisfactory |
| Overall 2012 Rating  | (S) Satisfactory |
| 2013 Rating | (S) Satisfactory |
| Comments | A Satisfactory rating for this reporting period is given by the Egyptian Environmental Affairs Agency (EEAA) / the Ministry of State for Environmental Affairs (MoSEA), as the project is progressing well toward achieving its development objectives, is following the project workplan for 2012/2013, and is fully integrated with the Government\'s strategies and plans. Significant efforts have been made by the Project Team to implement the pilot projects that are expected to start by the end of 2013. The project management succeeded in obtaining the commitment and political support of the senior government officials who have been changed several times, and to continue with the project activities in spite of the existing interrupted situation in Egypt in the period following the revolution. Changes in government officials delayed the decision making for the pilot projects, and the economic uncertainty had some impact on private sector stakeholders\' (investors and sponsors) plans. The Transportation Programme in the Development Research and Technological Planning Center, Cairo University, continued to provide technical support to the project in the field of transport planning and engineering. A Mid-Term Evaluation was conducted by UNDP, and it concluded that: a) the execution of the project is not simple due to the wide range of Government and non-governmental stakeholders involved, and the difficulties in reaching agreements with all of them; b) the PMU has performed very well under these circumstances, and the planning and design of project outputs by the experts from the Transportation Programme in the Development Research and Technological Planning Center, Cairo University, are of high quality; c) the project has adequate budgetary resources to achieve its targets, but will need to receive advice external to Egyptian expertise on how to achieve the project objectives with the remaining resources; and finally d) concerning the project terminal date of December 31, 2013, there is insufficient time remaining to achieve project targets, and there is a need for extending the project to December 31, 2015, to provide sufficient time for the completion of the project outputs and advocate for replicating the pilot projects. The project facilitated the signature of a protocol between the Ministry of State for Environmental Affairs, Ministry of Housing, Ministry of Transport, and Governorate of Giza for implementing the pilot project for establishing a high quality public transport bus service inside the 6 of October City, and connecting it, Sheikh Zayed, and Dream Land Cities to the Metro in the Governorate of Giza. The project management continued coordination with the GEF Small Grants Programme (SGP) in Egypt to participate in financing and contributing to the implementation of the pilot projects (to support the establishment of the non-motorized walking and cycling tracks) through support to local NGOs in Menofia and Fayoum Governorates. The project management also conducted negotiations with the Social Fund for Development (SFD) for participation in financing the 2 pilot projects for constructing the walking and cycling tracks in Menofia and Fayoum Governorates. Negotiations succeeded, and a protocol was signed between Fayoum Governorate and SFD for financing the pilot in Fayoum City. Cooperation and joint efforts have been conducted between the project management and the Embassy of the Kingdom of the Netherlands and the Netherlands-Flemish Institute in Cairo for encouraging cycling, and arranging for implementation of the awareness component of the pilot project for constructing walking and cycling tracks in Fayoum and Menofia Cities. The Project Management Unit is successfully managing and coordinating the implementation of the activities of the GEF/UNDP Project and the French GEF/AFD Project \"Support to an Improved Urban Transport System in Cairo\". |
| **GEF Operational Focal point: Is the government representative in the country designed as the GEF operation focal point.** |
| HIGHLY RECOMMENDED but NOT mandatory for projects under implementation in one country. Not necessary for regional or global projects. |
| Please justify your rating and address the following points in your comments. Please keep word count between 200 words minimum and 500 words maximum.  |
| 1. | Explain why you gave a specific rating. |
| 2. | Note trends, both positive and negative, in achievement of outcomes as per the updated indicators provided in the DO sheet. |
| 3. | Provide recommendations for next steps.  |
| **GEF Operational Focal point** |
| Overall 2009 Rating  |  |
| Overall 2010 Rating  |  |
| Overall 2011 Rating  |  |
| Overall 2012 Rating  |  |
| 2013 Rating | (S) Satisfactory |
| Comments | The GEF Operational Focal Point is the Egyptian Environmental Affairs Agency (EEAA) / the Ministry of State for Environmental Affairs (MoSEA), which is also the Project Implementing Partner and the comments on rating are given below. |
| **Other Partners: For jointly implemented projects, a representative of the other Agency working with UNDP on project implementation (for example UNEP or the World Bank).** |
| RECOMMENDED but NOT MANDATORY for jointly implemented projects. |
| Please justify your rating and address the following points in your comments. Please keep word count between 200 words minimum and 500 words maximum.  |
| 1. | Explain why you gave a specific rating. |
| 2. | Note trends, both positive and negative, in achievement of outcomes as per the updated indicators provided in the DO sheet. |
| 3. | Provide recommendations for next steps.  |
| **Other Partners** |
| Overall 2009 Rating  |  |
| Overall 2010 Rating  |  |
| Overall 2011 Rating  |  |
| Overall 2012 Rating  |  |
| 2013 Rating | (-) No rating submitted or requested for this year |
| Comments |  |
| **UNDP Technical Adviser: Is the UNDP-GEF Technical Adviser.**  |
| MANDATORY RATING MUST BE PROVIDED for all projects. |
| Please justify your rating and address the following points in your comments. Please keep word count between 500 words minimum and 1200 words maximum.  |
| 1. | Explain why you gave a specific rating (do not repeat the project objective). |
| 2. | Note trends, both positive and negative, in achievement of outcomes as per the updated indicators provided in the DO sheet. |
| 3. | Fully explain the critical risks that have affected progress.  |
| 4. | Outline action plan to address projects with DO rating of HU, U or MU.  |
| **UNDP-GEF Technical Adviser** |
| Overall 2009 Rating  |  |
| Overall 2010 Rating  | (MS) Moderately Satisfactory |
| Overall 2011 Rating  | (S) Satisfactory |
| Overall 2012 Rating  | (MS) Moderately Satisfactory |
| 2013 Rating | (MS) Moderately Satisfactory |
| Comments | There is little doubt of the project\'s development potential. Not only are Egypt\'s cities, and most notably Greater Cairo, suffering from considerable transport-related problems (congestion and air pollution) but the Government is experiencing ever-greater difficulties subsidising transport fuels, which place a heavy burden on the state budget and impair the balance of payments. However, as with the previous reporting period, there has been a sense of unrealised expectation associated with the project in the past 12 months, as stakeholders wait for the project\'s development potential to be translated into concrete development outcomes. The project has made commendable progress in finalising the designs of the demonstration projects and securing renewed stakeholder commitments. The signing of a formal protocol with the Ministry of Transport, the Ministry of Housing and Urban Development, the Ministry of State for Environmental Affairs and Giza Governorate should, at least in principle, protect the Greater Cairo-satellite cities bus lines demonstration project from further changes of Government personnel. The pilot bus priority system and variable-message parking signs in Cairo will be implemented imminently. The non-motorised transport pilot in Fayoum City is ready to proceed and has been boosted, thanks to project intervention, with $286,000 support from the Egyptian Social Fund for Development. There is agreement from the relevant stakeholders to establish a demonstration integrated \'one stop shop\' environmental and technical vehicle testing centre for Greater Cairo. If these pilot investments can demonstrate sustained reductions in urban transport-related fuel consumption and energy intensity, significant additional indirect emission reductions are expected from municipal governments and the private sector increasing their investments in improved public transport, NMT infrastructure and traffic demand measures. Nonetheless, as with the previous reporting period, the project has devoted considerable efforts to \'running to keep still\' - to reaffirming Government approvals from officials who have changed repeatedly. Actual implementation of the pilot projects is unlikely before early 2014 (with the possible exception of the variable-message parking signs), even assuming no more interruptions arising from the political uncertainty in the country. As a result, direct emission reductions attributable to the project are still zero, and indirect emissions are negligible - though the long-term positive impact of the project\'s networking and awareness-raising activities should not be under-estimated in this context. The project has produced high-quality plans and reports and has done a commendable job of establishing its policy-relevance with a Government that has often been distracted by more urgent political/security concerns. If the project\'s technical support activities can be augmented by operational, successful demonstration projects, the project offers considerable development potential. This favourable situation may arise in the next reporting period. For the moment, a Moderately Satisfactory rating is justified. |
| Highly Satisfactory (HS) | Project is expected to achieve or exceed all its major global environmental objectives, and yield substantial global environmental benefits, without major shortcomings. The project can be presented as 'good practice'. |
| Satisfactory (S) | Project is expected to achieve most of its major global environmental objectives, and yield satisfactory global environmental benefits, with only minor shortcomings. |
| Moderately Satisfactory (MS) | Project is expected to achieve most of its major relevant objectives but with either significant shortcomings or modest overall relevance. Project is expected not to achieve some of its major global environmental objectives or yield some of the expected global environment benefits. |
| Moderately Unsatisfactory (MU)  | Project is expected to achieve its major global environmental objectives with major shortcomings or is expected to achieve only some of its major global environmental objectives. |
| Unsatisfactory (U) | Project is expected not to achieve most of its major global environment objectives or to yield any satisfactory global environmental benefits. |
| Highly Unsatisfactory (HU) | The project has failed to achieve, and is not expected to achieve, any of its major global environment objectives with no worthwhile benefits. |

IMPLEMENTATION PROGRESS RATING

|  |
| --- |
| IP rating: Please review the Implementation Progress page of this APR/PIR and then answer the questions below. An overall IP rating will be generated based on your answers.  |
| 1 Please rate the progress in delivery of outputs. For example, do the annual outputs represent sufficient progress in order to achieve the project outcomes (see DO page of this APR/PIR)? |
| 2 Please rate the efficiency in delivery of outputs. For example, in this reporting period are budget resources being spent as planned? (i.e. is project delivery on target?)  |
| 3 Please rate the quality of risk management. For example, in this reporting period were project risks managed effectively?  |
| 4 Please rate the quality of adaptive management. For example, in this reporting period were actions taken to address implementation issue identified in the APR/PIR last year?  |
| 5 Please rate the quality of monitoring and evaluation. For example, in this reporting period were sufficient financial resources allocated to project monitoring and evaluation |
| **Project Manager/Coordinator: Is the person managing the day to day operations of the project.** |
| MANDATORY RATING MUST BE PROVIDED for projects under implementation in one country or regional projects where appropriate. |
| Please justify your rating and address the following points in your comments. Please keep word count between 500 words minimum and 1200 words maximum. |
| 1. | Explain why you gave a specific rating. |
| 2. | Summarize annual progress and address timelines of projec output/activity completion in relation to annual workplans. |
| 3. | Outline the general status of project expenditures in relation to annual budgets, the effectiveness of project management units in guiding project implementation, and the responsiveness of the project board in overseeing project implementation. |
| **Overall 2009 Rating**  |  |
| **Overall 2010 Rating**  | (S) Satisfactory |
| **Overall 2011 Rating**  | (HS) Highly Satisfactory |
| **Overall 2012 Rating**  | (S) Satisfactory |
| **2013 Rating** | (S) Satisfactory |
| **Comments** | A Satisfactory rating for 2013 is given, as the implementation of the project’s 5 components has been progressing well according to the project workplan for 2012/2013. Nearly all of the field and office works for the pilot projects were conducted, and tendering of some pilots is ready for launching. The project management worked hard on renewing the approvals of new government officials, as many of the Ministers and Governors have changed several times. Solid cooperation continued between the project and different stakeholders (Cairo, Fayoum and Menofia Governorates, the Ministry of Housing and Urban Development, the Ministry of Transport, and the Ministry of Interior) for achieving the project objectives, and there continues to be solid political support and goodwill for the project, and commitment of a broad range of stakeholders. The Ministry of State for Environmental Affairs is providing strong support to project implementation. Continuation of the political instability in the country has affected the political decision-making process, which has delayed implementation decisions. In response, the project has pursued an adaptive strategy through an adjusted workplan for 2012/2013. Progress and challenges were presented in several meetings with the Minister of Environment, the EEAA CEO and the Project Steering Committee members, where decisions were taken to support successful implementation through direct contact and coordination (via meetings and letters) between the Minister of State for Environmental Affairs and the new Ministers and Governors (project stakeholders), and signing of protocols between the project stakeholders for various project activities. Experts of the Transportation Programme in the \"Development Research and Technological Planning Center\" (DRTPC), Cairo University continued to provide the required consultancy services and technical support for implementing the project activities in the field of transport planning and engineering. The Project Management Unit (PMU) continues to successfully coordinate the implementation of the STP activities with those of \"Support to an Improved Urban Transport System in Cairo Project\", funded by the Agence Francaise de Development (AFD). The project’s planned budget for 2009 was US$199,000 and the expenditure was $124,736 (63%); the planned budget for 2010 was $436,100 and the expenditure was $396,922 (91%); the planned budget for 2011 was $425,500 and the expenditure was $382,669 (90%); the planned budget for 2012 was $407,000 and the expenditure was $361,595 (89%); and the planned budget for 2013 is $1,300,000 and expenditure up to 30 June 2013 was $193,051 (15%). The expenditures to date for 2013 represent only 15% of the annual budgeted amount, but significant increases in expenditures are expected later this year when implementation of the non-motorised transport pilot projects in Fayoum and Menofia Governorates start. The Mid-Term Evaluation was conducted by UNDP in September 2012, and concluded that overall: 1) The execution of this project is not simple due to the wide range of Government and non-governmental stakeholders involved, and the difficulties in reaching agreements with all of them. 2) The PMU has performed very well under these circumstances, and the planning and design of project outputs by the experts from the Transportation Programme in the Development Research and Technological Planning Center, Cairo University, are of high quality. 3) The project has adequate budgetary resources to achieve its targets, but will need to receive advice external to Egyptian expertise on how to achieve the project\'s objectives with the remaining resources, and 4) With the project terminal date of December 31, 2013, there is insufficient time remaining to achieve project targets, and there is a need for extending the project to December 31, 2015, to provide sufficient time for the completion of the project outputs and advocate for replicating the pilot projects. |
| **UNDP Country Office Programme Officer: Is the UNDP programme officer in the UNDP country office who provides oversight and supervision support to the project.** |
| **MANDATORY RATING MUST BE PROVIDED for projects under implementation in one country. Not necessary for regional or global projects.**  |
| **Please justify your rating and address the following points in your comments. The QORs and delivery data in the ERBM portfolio project monitoring report should inform your rating. Please keep word count between 500 words minimum and 1200 words maximum.**  |
| **1.** | **Explain why you gave a specific rating. If your rating differs from the rating provided by the project manager please explain why.** |
| **2.** | **Summarize annual progress and address timeliness of project output/activity completion in relation to annual workplans.** |
| **3.** | **Outline the general status of project expenditures in relation to annual budgets, the effectiveness of project management units in guiding project implementation, and the responsiveness of the project board in overseeing project implementation.**  |
| **Overall 2009 Rating**  |  |
| **Overall 2010 Rating**  | (S) Satisfactory |
| **Overall 2011 Rating**  | (S) Satisfactory |
| **Overall 2012 Rating**  | (S) Satisfactory |
| **2013 Rating** | (S) Satisfactory |
| **Comments** | The project held a number of meetings with the newly-appointed relevant government officials and governors to introduce the project objectives. The project outcomes and outputs were very well received by the officials, but changes in government positions continued during this reporting period and this has certainly delayed the decision-making process for the pilot projects. Nevertheless, some actions have been taken and signals received during this year that will make the continuing change in senior government officials have less impact on pilot project implementation, as described below. During this reporting period, the project has undergone a Mid-Term Evaluation. Overall, the independent evaluator noted that the execution of this project is not simple due to the wide spectrum of government and non-governmental stakeholders involved, and the difficulties in reaching agreements with all of them. The conclusions of the evaluation highlighted that the project delays have been a direct result of the political instability and frequent changes of key government ministers and senior officials. However, the evaluator has acknowledged the adaptive management strategy pursued by the project management, reorienting the project towards tasks that did not require extensive involvement or approvals from government officials. The evaluator also confirmed that the current political climate appears supportive to the project as the new Government has been clear on its intent to gradually remove fuel subsidies and to save as much energy as possible, which sets the stage for implementing sustainable transport pilots. In general, the UNDP Country Office agrees with the evaluator’s findings, although there are concerns on specific recommendations that need further investigation. The evaluator indicated that the project has adequate budgetary resources to achieve its targets; however, he suggested a no-cost project extension of two years to enable achievement of these targets. During this reporting period, the project succeeded in facilitating the signature of a cooperation protocol involving the Ministry of Housing, the Ministry of Transport, the Governorate of Giza and the Ministry of Environment that confirms the Government’s commitments towards the implementation of the pilot project of the high quality bus service inside the Six of October City and shuttle buses connecting the city to Cairo. The cooperation protocol not only confirms the institutions’ interest and commitment in the pilot projects but it also includes the roles and responsibilities of the four partner entities needed for the implementation of the pilot project. Furthermore, the protocol is expected to protect the project from further delays associated with the frequent changes in senior government officials. The Evaluator noted that the project expenditure since its inception is less than 20% of the total budget. The rate of expenditure is expected to increase dramatically once the work on the pilot projects is initiated. The project achieved a delivery rate of 89% for the past year, although the disbursements are much lower than originally planned in the project document due to the political conditions, as explained above. The project is given a Satisfactory rating for this year – although the pilots have not yet started, the significant efforts exerted by the project team to prepare the ground for pilot project implementation leaves the project in a strong position moving forward. |
| **Project Implementing Partner: Is the representative of the executing agency (in GEF terminology). This would be Government (for NEX/NIM execution) or NGO (for CSO Execution) or an official from the Executing Agency (for example UNOPS).**  |
| **RECOMMENDED but NOT mandatory for projects under implementation in one country or regional projects.** |
| **Please justify your rating and address the following points in your comments. Please keep word count between 200 words minimum and 500 words maximum.** |
| **1.** | **Explain why you gave a specific rating.** |
| **2.** | **Note trends, both positive and negative.** |
| **3.** | **Provide recommendations for next steps.**  |
| **Overall 2009 Rating** |  |
| **Overall 2010 Rating** |  |
| **Overall 2011 Rating** | (HS) Highly Satisfactory |
| **Overall 2012 Rating** | (S) Satisfactory |
| **2013 Rating** | (S) Satisfactory |
| **Comments** | A Satisfactory rating for this reporting period is given by the Egyptian Environmental Affairs Agency (EEAA) / the Ministry of State for Environmental Affairs (MoSEA), in its capacity as the Project Implementing Partner. Implementation of the pilot projects is progressing well according to the 2012 / 2013 work plan, as nearly most of the field and design works for the pilot projects have been conducted and tenders for some pilots are ready for launching. The project management, with support from EEAA / MoSEA and UNDP, succeeded in obtaining the political support and approvals of senior government officials (stakeholders) who have been changed several times, and to continue with the technical activities in spite of the existing interrupted situation in Egypt in the period following the revolution. Good cooperation continues with the project stakeholders for achieving project implementation, and there is solid political support and commitment of a broad range of stakeholders. The economic uncertainty had some impact on private sector stakeholders\' (investors and sponsors) plans. The Project Management Unit (PMU) is managing and coordinating the implementation of the activities of the GEF/UNDP project and the French GEF/AFD project in a satisfactory manner. |
| **GEF Operational Focal point: Is the government representative in the country designed as the GEF operation focal point.** |
| **MANDATORY RATING MUST BE PROVIDED for projects under implementation in one country. Not necessary for regional or global projects.**  |
| **Please justify your rating and address the following points in your comments. Please keep word count between 200 words minimum and 500 words maximum.** |
| **1.** | **Explain why you gave a specific rating.** |
| **2.** | **Note trends, both positive and negative.** |
| **3.** | **Provide recommendations for next steps.**  |
| **Overall 2009 Rating**  |  |
| **Overall 2010 Rating**  |  |
| **Overall 2011 Rating**  |  |
| **Overall 2012 Rating**  |  |
| **2013 Rating** | (S) Satisfactory |
| **Comments** | The GEF Operational Focal Point is the Egyptian Environmental Affairs Agency (EEAA) / the Ministry of State for Environmental Affairs (MoSEA), which is also the Project Implementing Partner and the comments on rating are given below. |
| **Other Partners: For jointly implemented projects, a representative of the other Agency working with UNDP on project implementation (for example UNEP or the World Bank).** |
| **RECOMMENDED but NOT mandatory for jointly implemented projects.**  |
| **Please justify your rating and address the following points in your comments. Please keep word count between 200 words minimum and 500 words maximum.**  |
| **1.** | **Explain why you gave a specific rating.** |
| **2.** | **Note trends, both positive and negative.** |
| **3.** | **Provide recommendations for next steps.**  |
| **Overall 2009 Rating**  |  |
| **Overall 2010 Rating**  |  |
| **Overall 2011 Rating**  |  |
| **Overall 2012 Rating**  |  |
| **2013 Rating** | (-) No rating submitted or requested for this year |
| **Comments** |  |
| **UNDP Technical Adviser: Is the UNDP-GEF Technical Adviser.** |
| **MANDATORY RATING MUST BE PROVIDED for ALL projects.** |
| **Please justify your rating and address the following points in your comments. The QORs and delivery data in the ERBM portfolio project monitoring report should inform your rating. Please keep word count between 500 words minimum and 1200 words maximum.**  |
| **1.** | **Explain why you gave a specific rating. If your rating differs from the rating provided by the UNDP Country Office Programme Officer and/or the Project Manager please explain why.** |
| **2.** | **Summarize annual progress and address timelines of project output/activity completion in relation to annual workplans.** |
| **3.** | **Outline the general status of project expenditures in relation to annual budgets, the effectiveness of project management units in guiding project implementation, and the responsiveness of the project board in overseeing project implementation.** |
| **UNDP Technical Adviser** |
| **Overall 2009 Rating**  |  |
| **Overall 2010 Rating**  | (MS) Moderately Satisfactory |
| **Overall 2011 Rating**  | (S) Satisfactory |
| **Overall 2012 Rating**  | (MS) Moderately Satisfactory |
| **2013 Rating** | (MU) Moderately Unsatisfactory |
| **Comments** | Project implementation in this reporting period has, as in previous reporting periods, been delayed by the interaction of three factors: (1) the ongoing political uncertainty in the country, which has seen the previous government replaced by a new, interim government and rapid turnover of government officials (principally the key decision-makers such as ministers, regional governors and heads of agencies) - such turbulence has inevitably affected the continuity of policy-making; (2) the institutional complexity of the transport sector, which is characterised by overlapping (and often unclear) official mandates and decision-making responsibilities (complicated to an even greater extent by the arrival of a new agency, the Agency for Regulating Urban Transport in Greater Cairo, with an as-yet undefined remit); and (3) the \'front line\' nature of the transport sector as far as the general public is concerned - roadworks and disruptions to public transport routes have the potential to inconvenience (and often anger) citizens, at a time when the government is keen to avoid social tensions. Taken together, these factors have served to delay (again) the implementation of the project\'s demonstration activities - the bus lanes, the bike lanes, the Metro feeder bus services and the integrated vehicle testing centre. The Project Management Unit have exercised diligent adaptive management, focusing on studies, designs and desk work during periods when it was clear that implementation of the demonstration projects would be impossible. The quality of these outputs has been very high. The project has also secured some notable successes in terms of engagement of stakeholders and leveraging additional financial resources (e.g. the $286,000 secured from the Social Fund for Development). Nonetheless, the activities undertaken to date must be recognised for what they are - as means to ends, rather than objectives in themselves. Without the demonstration projects operational and visible, the project will not succeed in its central objective of directly and indirectly reducing greenhouse gas emissions. The key implementation challenge - and simultaneously risk - looking forward is to successfully implement the demonstration projects as rapidly as possible, and certainly within the coming 16 months of existing project lifetime (i.e. up to December 2014). This will, of course, be facilitated if the political situation stabilises, an outcome that is highly uncertain at the current time. At less than 20% in cumulative terms since project commencement, budget mobilisation is low - largely because of the inability to date to implement the demonstration projects. When the demonstration projects are implemented, and currently this is envisaged to be in early 2014, budget expenditures will increase substantially. The project has been, and continues to be, implemented in an effective manner. The implementation problems encountered by the project have been largely outside of the project\'s control. The PMU is to be congratulated for taking the project as far as it has gone. Nonetheless, regardless of the non-conducive political environment, the fact is that the project is behind schedule and under-budget and a Moderately Unsatisfactory rating best captures this state of affairs. |
| **Highly Satisfactory (HS)** | **Implementation of all components is in substantial compliance with the original/formally revised implementation plan for the project. The project can be presented as 'good practice'.** |
| **Satisfactory (S)** | **Implementation of most components is in substantial compliance with the original/formally revised plan except for only few that are subject to remedial action.** |
| **Moderately Satisfactory (MS)** | **Implementation of some components is in substantial compliance with the original/formally revised plan with some components requiring remedial action.** |
| **Moderately Unsatisfactory (MU)**  | **Implementation of some components is not in substantial compliance with the original/formally revised plan with most components requiring remedial action.** |
| **Unsatisfactory (U)** | **Implementation of most components is not in substantial compliance with the original/formally revised plan.**  |
| **Highly Unsatisfactory (HU)** | **Implementation of none of the components is in substantial compliance with the original/formally revised plan.** |

PROGRESS IN PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION

|  |
| --- |
| **Outcome 1- Key Outputs this Reporting Period: The concept for new, integrated high-quality public transport services (to exert shift from private cars) for Cairo and its satellite cities successfully introduced and replicated on the basis of public-private partnerships.** |
| 1) Preparatory work for the pilot project for executing three new, high-quality public transportation bus services connecting Greater Cairo with 6 October City, Sheikh Zayed City, Media Production City / Dream Land to metro line number 2 in Greater Cairo, as well as two feeder bus lines running in 6th October, has been completed, including the studies, field surveys, identification of suitable land for bus stops and terminals and design works (highway and civil engineering design works). 2) A protocol for implementing the above-mentioned pilot project has been signed between the main stakeholders - the Ministry of State for Environmental Affairs, the Ministry of Transport, the Ministry of Housing and Urban Development, and Giza Governorate. The protocol includes commitments and agreed responsibilities of the different partners towards implementation of the pilot project. Many of the top government officials were changed during 2012/2013 and the written protocol represents an attempt by the project to ensure uninterrupted execution of the pilot project even if there are further personnel changes. 3) Agreement on the institutional setup of the pilot project was reached and, accordingly, Giza Governorate will delegate to 6th October and Sheikh Zayed New Urban Communities Authorities (NUCAs) the supervision and monitoring of the new private-sector bus line operators. Also, it was agreed with the Metro Company to integrate the ticketing system for the new bus lines with the existing metro lines # 1, 2 and 3, after the Metro Company has made significant investments in enhancing the ticketing system of these lines. 4) Approval of 6 October and Sheikh Zayed New Urban Communities Authorities to allocate identified appropriate land for the terminals and garages serving the new bus lines. A decree for these allocations will be issued by NUCA. |
| **Outcome 2- Key Outputs this Reporting Period: The modal share of non-motorized transport in middle-size provincial cities increased or sustained.** |
| 1) Approvals of the new Menofia and Fayoum Governors secured for implementing the non-motorized transport corridors for walking and cycling in Shebin El Kom and Fayoum Cities, as during 2012/2013 the Governor of Menofia has been changed twice and the Governor of Fayoum once. 2) All engineering designs, drawings and tender documents of the two pilot projects completed in full coordination with, and approved by, the local authorities in the two governorates and are ready for tendering. The total length of the non-motorised corridor in each city is about 14 linear km. 3) The project management conducted negotiations with the Social Fund for Development (SFD) for co-funding the pilot projects’ implementation in the two Governorates. Negotiations succeeded, and a protocol was signed between Fayoum Governorate and SFD for financing the pilot in Fayoum City with LE 2 million (approximately $286,000). 4) Project management continued coordination with the GEF Small Grants Programme (SGP) in Egypt to participate in financing the implementation of some of the pilot project activities by the local NGOs in Monofia and Fayoum Governorates. Two NGOs from Monofia - the Egyptian Association for the Advancement of Women and Children, and El Taqua Association - signed MoUs with SGP for obtaining funds. A consultation workshop involving Fayoum NGOs has been conducted, and proposals were received from two NGOs that are about to be approved. |
| **Outcome 3- Key Outputs this Reporting Period: Successful introduction of the Transport Demand Management (TDM) concept with an objective to expand it towards more aggressive measures over time to effectively discourage the use of private cars, when good quality public transport services are available.** |
| 1) Approval of Cairo Governorate for implementing the two Transport Demand Management (TDM) pilot projects: a) applying public transport bus priority system at traffic signals in Moustafa El Nahas Corridor; b) introducing variable message parking signs to guide cars to the appropriate parking facilities around the city centre, has been renewed, as the Cairo Governor was changed again in August 2012. 2) Request For Proposals (RFP) for international companies to provide design, supply, installation and maintenance of the system for introducing variable message parking signs to guide cars to the appropriate parking facilities around the city centre, has been prepared, approved by Cairo Governorate, launched, proposals received, and are under evaluation. 3) RFP for international companies to provide design, supply, installation and maintenance of the system for introducing the public transport bus priority system at traffic signals in Moustafa El Nahas Corridor has been prepared, approved by Cairo Governorate, and is ready to be launched. Cairo Governorate is studying the integration of that system with another project under design by Cairo Governorate for developing Moustafa El Nahas Corridor. |
| **Outcome 4- Key Outputs this Reporting Period: Improved energy efficiency of freight transport** |
| 1) The Egyptian Environmental Affairs Authority (EEAA) and the Ministry of Interior (MoI) have agreed to establish one integrated station for vehicle environmental and technical inspection in Greater Cairo as a pilot project. MoI is committed to the establishment of the station but, due to the political instability in the country, the pilot project has been put on hold for the moment. Implementation is expected to start in 2014. 2) A report on recommendations (excluding recommendations related to infrastructure) in previous transport studies from 2000-2012 to improve national freight transport on road, rail and river has been prepared and sent to the Minister of Transport to investigate appropriate sustainable transport measures that can be supported by the project. Recommendations covered the areas of freight transport regulations, policies, institutional arrangements, investment, capacity building, fees, operation, maintenance, marketing, quality control, information centers, required future studies, multimodal transport logistics and customs. 3) Report on “Updating Situation Analysis and Policy Recommendations for Energy Efficient Urban Freight Transport in Egypt” has been prepared. 4) Report on the importance of truck inter-modal terminals for freight transport in urban areas was prepared. |
| **Outcome 5- Key Outputs this Reporting Period: Strengthened institutional capacity to promote sustainable transport sector development during and after the project.** |
| 1) Concerning the field study for determination of fuel-based emission factors of private cars and taxis with gasoline engines under local driving conditions in Greater Cairo using on-board measuring equipment, the analysis of recorded field measurements for gas emissions from vehicles, estimation of emission factors correlations, and the final report have been completed. Lessons learned from that study have been very useful for the field study being conducted by EEAA under the AFD / French GEF project for determination of fuel-based emission factors of diesel engine vehicles (buses, minibuses and microbuses) under local driving conditions in Greater Cairo using on-board measuring equipment, as the results of that study will complement the results of the GEF study. 2) Cooperation and joint efforts have been conducted between the project and the Dutch Embassy for encouraging cycling, and arranging for implementation of the awareness component of the pilot project for constructing non-motorized corridor for cycling and pedestrians in Fayoum and Menofia Cities. The Project Manager and part of the project technical team participated in an awareness seminar about cycling organized by the Embassy of the Kingdom of the Netherlands and the Netherlands-Flemish Institute in Cairo, in cooperation with Green Arm of Nahdat El-Mahrousa NGO, in which the Dutch and Egyptian experts discussed opportunities for cycling in Egypt as means of transport and the Project Manager made a presentation about the NMT pilot project. 3) The training programme for EEAA technical staff on emission factor measurements and modeling has been arranged. The training will cover several items, including: use of on-board instruments, planning field work for data collection, and data analysis and modeling of emission factors. |
| **Outcome 6- Key Outputs this Reporting Period: Monitoring, learning, adaptive feedback and evaluation** |
| 1) The Mid-Term Evaluation was conducted by UNDP in September 2012, and the final report and the Management Response Report have been finalized. 2) During 2012 / 2013, nearly all of the field and office works for the pilot projects were ready, and the project management worked hard on renewing the approvals of new government officials. 3) Continuation of the political instability in the country has affected the political decision-making process, which has served to delay implementation decisions. In response, the project has pursued an adaptive strategy through an adjusted workplan for 2012 / 2013. |

Adjustments

Adjustments to Project Milestones, Project Strategy and Risk Management.

Key Project Milestones

Have significant delays occurred in the project start, inception workshop, Mid-term Review, Terminal Evaluation or project duration?

Yes

If yes, were these changes reported in a previous APR/PIR?

No

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Key project milestone** | **Scope of delay (in months)** | **Briefly describe change or reason for change** | **Briefly describe the implications or consequences this has had on project implementation** |
| Project Start (i.e. project document signature date) |  |  |  |
| Inception Workshop |  |  |  |
| Mid-term Review |  |  |  |
| Terminal Evaluation |  |  |  |
| Project Duration (i.e. project extension) | 12 | The Mid-term Review recommended extending the project to December 31, 2015, to provide sufficient time for the completion of the project Outputs and advocate for replicating the pilot projects. | With the agreement of the UNDP-GEF unit, the project terminal date has been extended by an additional 12 months (to 31 December 2014) with a possibility of another 12-month extension after that if project progress has been judged to be sufficient. |

Adjustments to Project Strategy

Has the project made any changes to its strategy (i.e. logframe/results framework) since the Project Document was signed?

Yes

If yes, were these changes reported in a previous APR/PIR?

No

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Change Made to** | **Yes/No** | **Briefly describe the change and the reason for that change** |
| Project Objective | No |  |
| Project Outcomes | No | <strong> </strong> |
| Project Outputs/Activities | Yes | Output 3.2: concerning supporting the project for TDM measures, implementing mobile phone traffic congestion applications was added, and several alternative corridors for implementing this application were proposed. Output 3.5: Introduction of staggered parking charges to discourage private cars from entering the city center has been cancelled due to the economic situation in the country. Output 4.1: the adopted legal and regulatory changes and incentives for improving the energy efficiency of freight transport has been replaced by preparing recommendations related to truck freight transport improvements based on a comprehensive review of national transport studies in the past 15 years and estimation of urban fuel usage. Output 4.2: One new integrated environmental and technical inspection station for vehicles in operation with trained staff instead of 10 new inspection and tuning stations. Output 4.4: Report on the importance of inter-modality in freight transport instead of enhanced capacity of the management and envisaged users of the planned two new intermodal terminal facilities to facilitate their effective use. Output 5.1 (new Output): Emission factors for selected motor vehicles under typical urban driving conditions in Cairo. This is a new Output added to the Outputs in the original Project Document Logical Framework, so the numbering of Outputs under Component # 5 were shifted. Output 5.2 (originally 5.1): changed to be: Enhanced capacity of personnel from the central government and governorates on integrated urban land use and sustainable passenger and freight transport in provincial cities, and effective coordination in the development of the public transport systems in Cairo and other major urban centers in Egypt, Instead of: Key professional groups trained on different aspects of sustainable transport. Output 5.4 (originally 5.3 and 5.5): changed to be: Enhanced capacity of the Ministry of Transport and its underlying agencies in the area of sustainable transport to effectively co-ordinate the development of the public transport systems in Cairo and other major urban centers in Egypt, Instead of: The Greater Cairo Metropolitan Transport Bureau (GCMTB) to effectively co-ordinate the development of the public transport systems in the Greater Cairo area established and its capacity built. The new Agency for Regulating Transport in Greater Cairo, under the Ministry of Transport, is still at an early stage of establishment, and its mandate and organization are still being developed (not clearly identified). Output 5.4 (originally): A semi-public Greater Cairo Parking Authority (GCPA) to implement and, in close collaboration with other key authorities, to enforce parking policies established by the end of the project and its capacity built. This output was cancelled because, after the Revolution on 25 January 2011, it became extremely difficult to set up new institutional and regulatory frameworks for parking policies in Cairo’s CBD. |

Risk Management

List number of critical risks as noted in the ATLAS risk log and briefly describe actions undertaken this reporting period to address each critical risk.

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **# of Critical Risks (type/description)** | **Risk management measures undertaken this reporting period** |
| Political | The recent events in Egypt have resulted in changing the Cabinet and Governors several times since January 2011 which means that agreements with Ministers and Governors on the implementation of pilots have to be renewed and project activities have to r-introduced several times. The project management worked hard on renewing the approvals of the new government officials, and took the approach of signing a protocol with the involved stakeholders for implementing the pilot projects. The project management has pursued an adaptive strategy through an adjusted workplan for 2012 / 2013. |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |

Adjustments general comments:

Finance: cumulative from project start to June 30 2013

DISBURSEMENT OF GEF GRANT FUNDS

How much of the total GEF grant as noted in Project Document plus any project preparation grant has been spent so far? (e.g. PPG + MSP or FSP amount. Do not break down by PPG or project budget.)

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
|  Estimated cumulative total disbursement as of 30 June 2013. (i.e.CDR information up to 20 June 2013) | 1633657.00 |
| Add any comments on GEF Grant Funds | Estimated cumulative total disbursement as of 30 June 2013. (i.e. CDR information up to 20 June 2013). |

DISBURSEMENT OF CO-FINANCING

How much of the total Co-financing as noted in Project Document has been spent so far? Co-financing is the amount committed in the project document for which co-financing letters are available

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Estimated cumulative total co-financing disbursed as of 30 June this year. Please breakdown by donor. | 13060000.00 |
| Add any comments on co-financing including other types and amounts of additional co-financing such as in-kind, private sector, grants, credits and loans. | Planned co-financing should be 37,100,000 USD instead of shown 28,570,000 USD. Under the Project Component # 1: Ministry of Housing and Urban Development has upgraded the July 26th transport corridor to better accommodate public buses, and allocated land for the bus terminals and depots in 6 October and Sheikh Zayed Cities (US$ 10m) (as per ProDoc). Ministry of Transport is installing new ticketing machines in the Metro System that can be integrated with the contactless units bus system (cost yet to be verified). Under the Project Component # 5: UNDP/GOPP/UN-HABITAT completed Greater Cairo Plan Strategic Plan (US$ 3m) (as per ProDoc). Project Management expenses by EEAA (US$ 60,000). |

ADDITIONAL LEVERAGED RESOURCES

These additional resources can be from the same donors or new donors.

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Estimated cumulative leveraged resources as of 30 June 2013 | 1370000.00 |
| Add any comments on Leveraged Resources. | US$ 30,639 Government cash contribution. Euro 1 million parallel leveraged funding was secured from AFD / FFEM after an agreement signed between the Egyptian and French Governments to implement the Project \\\"Support to An Improved Urban Transport System In Cairo\\\" that complements the ongoing UNDP-GEF project. The AFD project is managed through the same Project Management Unit (PMU) as the GEF project. |

Other Financial Instruments

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Does the project provide funds to other Financial Instruments? | N |
| If yes, please discuss developments that occurred this reporting period only. |  |

Communications and KM

Tell the Story of Your Project and What has been Achieved this Reporting Period

The population of Egypt in 2013 is about 84 million, and is growing by 1.5 million per year. Together with the growing economy, this is inevitably putting more pressure on the country’s transportation system, increasing the energy use of the transport sector and related greenhouse gas emissions. The problems are particularly acute in the Greater Cairo area, one of the world’s mega-cities with a population of more than 17 million and where the demand for mobility has greatly outpaced the capacity of the public transportation system to cope. The gap has been primarily filled with privately-owned and operated shared taxis (so called informal transport) and the use of private cars. Consequently, congestion has become a major problem and the air quality has deteriorated to an alarming level. The Sustainable Transport Project for Egypt is a six-year GEF project (2009-2014), with a total budget of US$ 44 million. The Global Environment Facility (GEF) / United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) provides funding of US$ 7 million, and the local contribution of the Egyptian Government and private sector is $37 million. The Executing Agency is the Egyptian Environmental Affairs Agency / Ministry of State for Environmental Affairs (EEAA/MoSEA). The main stakeholders are the Ministry of Transport, the Ministry of Housing and Urban Development, the Ministry of Interior, Cairo, Giza, Fayoum, Menofia Governorates, and the private sector. The project aims to reduce the growth of energy consumption and the related greenhouse gas emissions of the transport sector in Egypt, while simultaneously mitigating the local environmental and other problems of increasing traffic, such as deteriorating urban air quality and congestion. This is to be achieved by increasing or sustaining the modal share of public and non-motorized transportation options, discouraging the use of private cars and facilitating freight transportation through more energy efficient truck operations and increasing the share of cargo transported on rail and inland waterways. The project is envisaged to achieve this by working with the following sustainable transport concepts via 5 Components: Component # 1: Initiating the concept for the development of new, integrated high quality public transport services for Greater Cairo and its satellite cities (to exert shift from car use) and facilitating its effective replication: Under this Component, the studies, field surveys and design works (highway and civil engineering design works) have been completed for pilot projects to execute 3 new, high-quality public transportation bus services connecting Greater Cairo with 6 October City, Sheikh Zayed City, Media Production City / Dream Land to metro line number 2 in Greater Cairo, as well as 2 feeder bus lines running in 6 October. The tendering process is under way for hiring international consultants to review the design of the public transport bus services for the new five lines, and for preparing concession contracts between the bus operator and Urban Development Agency for operating and maintaining the 5 new bus routes. A protocol for implementing the pilot project has been signed between the Ministry of State for Environmental Affairs, the Ministry of Transport, the Ministry of Housing and Urban Development, and Giza Governorate. Component # 2: Promoting non-motorized transport in medium sized provincial cities: Under this Component, all designs and tender documents of the 2 pilot projects for implementing the non-motorized transport corridors for walking and cycling in Shebin El Kom and Fayoum Cities respectively have been completed in full coordination with the Menofia and Fayoum Governorates, approved by them, and are ready for tendering. The total length of the non-motorized corridor in each city is about 14 km. Project management negotiations with the Social Fund for Development (SFD) for participation in financing the implementation of the 2 pilot projects succeeded, and a protocol was signed between Fayoum Governorate and SFD for financing the pilot in Fayoum with LE 2 million (approximately US$ 286,000). The GEF Small Grants Programme (SGP) in Egypt agreed to participate the financing of the implementation of some of the pilot project activities by local NGOs in Menfoia and Fayoum Governorates. Two NGOs from Menofia signed Memorandums of Agreement with SGP for obtaining funds. Component # 3: Introducing new traffic demand management measures, with an objective to gradually scale them up over the time: Under this Component, studies, surveys and conceptual design for 2 Transport Demand Management (TDM) pilot projects: a) applying public transport bus priority system at traffic signals in Moustafa El Nahas Corridor; and b) introducing variable message parking signs (VMPS) to guide cars to the appropriate parking facilities around the city centre have been completed and approved by Cairo Governorate. Tendering of international companies to provide design, supply, installation and maintenance services for the 2 systems has been proceeding. Component # 4: Improving the energy efficiency of freight transport: Under this Component, the Egyptian Environmental Affairs Agency (EEAA) and the Ministry of Interior (MoI) have agreed to establish one integrated station for vehicle environmental and technical inspection in Greater Cairo as a pilot project (the feasibility study was prepared by the project). The pilot project has been put on hold for the moment due to the political instability in the country. The project has prepared the following reports: 1) Recommendations (excluding that related to infra structure) in previous transport studies from 2000-2012 to improve national freight transport on road, rail and river in areas of regulations, policies, institutional arrangements, investment, capacity building, fees, operation, maintenance, marketing, quality control, information centers, required future studies, multimodal transport logistics, and customs; 2) Updating Situation Analysis and Policy Recommendations for Energy Efficient Urban Freight Transport in Egypt; 3) Importance of truck inter-modal terminals of freight transport in urban areas. Component # 5: Enhancing the awareness and capacity and strengthening the institutional basis to promote sustainable transport during and after the project: For the first time in Egypt, a field study for determination of fuel-based emission factors of private cars and taxis with gasoline engines under local driving conditions in Greater Cairo using on-board measuring equipment has been conducted. The analysis of recorded field measurements for gas emissions from vehicles, estimation of emission factors correlations, and the Final Report have been completed. Lessons learned from that study have been very useful for the field study being conducted by EEAA under the AFD / French GEF project for determination of fuel-based emission factors of diesel engine vehicles (buses, minibuses &amp; microbuses) under local driving conditions in Greater Cairo using on-board measuring equipment. The project will assist in enhancing the capacity of the Ministry of Transport and its agencies (river and rail authorities and General Authority for Roads, Bridges and Land Transport, GARBLT) in the area of sustainable transport to effectively co-ordinate the development of the public transport systems in Cairo and other major urban centers in Egypt. The project will also conduct a training programme for local authority engineers in the main cities for building the local capacity for integrated urban land use and transport planning in the area of sustainable passenger and freight transport.

Adaptive Management this Reporting Period

The interrupted situation, and continuation of the political instability in Egypt since the Egyptian Revolution on 25 January 2011, have resulted in: a) delayed decisions in the local authorities and the government concerning the outputs of the project; b) a need to renew approvals of the new top officials in Ministries, Governorates and Cities, as many of them have been changed (sometimes more than once); and c) a negative impact on private sector stakeholders\' plans. The project management has pursued an adaptive strategy through an adjusted workplan for 2012 / 2013. The project management worked hard on renewing the approvals of the new government officers and taking the approach of signing an official protocol with the involved stakeholders for implementing the pilot projects. The project management also conducted negotiations with the Social Fund for Development (SFD) for participation in financing pilot project implementation in Fayoum and Menofia Governorates. Negotiations succeeded, and a protocol was signed between Fayoum Governorate and SFD for financing the pilot in Fayoum City with LE 2 millions. SFD also agreed to participate in financing the other pilot in Menofia. Project management coordinated with the GEF Small Grants Programme (SGP) in Egypt to participate in financing the implementation of some of the pilot project activities by local NGOs in Menfoia and Fayoum Governorates.

Lessons Learned

After the Egyptian Revolution in January 2011, there was significant political instability in Egypt, accompanied by changes in national plans and strategies. Since then, the project has been making adaptive responses to deal with the ongoing changes, to redesign and redirect project activities to integrate with the new national plans and strategies within the framework of the project document, to renew approvals and obtain political support of the new top government officers, and also exert more effort to encourage / attract the private sector to participate in implementation. Lessons learned are that there must be flexibility in developing and implementing the project activities within the framework of the project document, making sure all the time that the project activities are integrating with the national plans and strategies, to have the political support of the government, and to ensure partnership of the private sector.

PARTNERSHIPS

Civil Society Organisations/NGOs

Local NGOs in Menofia and Fayoum Governorates will participate in the implementation of some of the activities of the pilot projects for establishment of the non-motorized walking and cycling tracks in these Governorates. Financing will be via the GEF Small Grants Programme (SGP) in Egypt in coordination with the STP project management. Two NGOs from Menofia - the Egyptian Association for the Advancement of Women and Children, and El Taqua Association - signed \"Memorandums of Agreement\" with SGP for obtaining funds for awareness campaigns, establishment of bicycle parking racks and revolving funds for supporting bicycle purchases.

 A consultation workshop with the participation of Fayoum NGOs was conducted and proposals received from two NGOs, the Arab Association for Human Development and Community Service, and Al-Ber and El-Khadamat El-Islamia Association.

Indigenous Peoples

N/A

Private Sector

The private sector is planned to have a significant role in the implementation of project activities.

 The project management made considerable efforts to mobilize co-funding for the pilot projects’ implementation from private-sector CSR budgets, but it has proved difficult due to the deteriorating economic situation in the country, which has affected private sector plans.

 The private sector is expected to participate in the following pilot projects:

 1) Supply and operate the new, high-quality public transportation bus services connecting Greater Cairo with 6 October City, Sheikh Zayed City, Media Production City / Dream Land to metro line number 2 in Greater Cairo, as well as a feeder bus line running within 6 October (total of 5 bus routes). Meetings with the Transport Group in the American Chamber of Commerce and with the British-Egyptian Business Association have been organized to coordinate with potential bus service providers before announcing the bus tender.

 2) Provide 50% of the cost for constructing the non-motorized transport (NMT) corridors in Shebin El Kom City in Menofia Governorate and in Fayoum City in Fayoum Governorate.

 3) Participate with EEAA and the Ministry of Interior in establishing/operating integrated stations for vehicle environmental and technical inspection in Greater Cairo.

 The private sector firms will be selected on the basis of transparent tender processes.

GEF Small Grants Programme

Project management continued coordination with the GEF Small Grants Programme (SGP) in Egypt to participate in financing and contributing to the implementation of the pilot projects (to support the establishment of the non-motorized walking and cycling tracks) through support to local NGOs in Menofia and Fayoum Governorates.

 Two NGOs from Menofia signed \"Memorandums of Agreement\" with SGP for obtaining funds. The SGP-supported activities will include awareness campaigns, establishment of bicycle parking racks and revolving funds for supporting bicycle purchases. The SGP grants are worth approximately $100,000 for the two recipient NGOs.

 A Consultation Workshop with Fayoum NGOs was conducted and proposals received from 2 NGOs.

Other Partners

The project management conducted negotiations with the Social Fund for Development (SFD) for participation in financing the 2 pilot projects for constructing non-motorized transport corridors for walking and cycling in Menofia and Fayoum Governorates. Negotiations succeeded, and a protocol was signed between Fayoum Governorate and SFD for financing the pilot in Fayoum City with LE 2 million (approximately US$ 286,000). SFD also agreed to participate in financing the other pilot in Menofia.

 Activities of the AFD / French GEF Project, \"Support to an Improved Urban Transport System in Cairo\", continue to be implemented in synergy with the UNDP-GEF Project. The AFD project is managed through the same Project Management Unit (PMU) as the GEF project.

 Cooperation and joint efforts have been conducted between the project management and the Embassy of the Kingdom of the Netherlands and the Netherlands-Flemish Institute in Cairo for encouraging cycling, and arranging for implementation of the awareness component of the pilot project for constructing non-motorized corridors for cycling and pedestrians in Fayoum and Menofia Cities.

PROGRESS IN ADDRESSING GENDER EQUALITY

Has a gender or social needs assessment been carried out?

No

If a gender or social assessment has been carried out what where the findings?

N/A

Does this project specifically target women or girls as direct beneficiaries?

No

Have there been any changes in specifically targeting women or girls as direct beneficiaries this reporting period?

No

If yes, please explain:

N/A

Please discuss any of the points above further or provide any other information on the project's work on gender equality undertaken this reporting period

Some points to consider: impact of project on daily workload of women, # of jobs created for women, impact of project on time spent by women in household activities, impact of project on primary school enrolment for girls/boys, increase in women's income etc. Be as specific as possible and provide real numbers (e.g. 100 women farmers participating in sustainable livelihoods programme).

Under Project Component # 1, a pilot project will be implemented for establishing 3 new, high-quality public transportation bus services connecting Greater Cairo with 6 October City, Sheikh Zayed City, Media Production City / Dream Land to metro line number 2 in Greater Cairo, as well as 2 feeder bus lines running in 6 October.

 The design of some elements of this pilot project will consider women’s interests to attract them to use the new service - for example, allocating some seats in the buses for women only. These issues will be assessed during the first period of operating the new buses.

ENVIRONMENTAL OR SOCIAL GRIEVANCE

What environmental or social issue was the grievance related to?

What is the current status of the grievance?

How would you rate the significance of the grievance?

Please describe the on-going or resolved grievance noting who was involved, what action was taken to resolve the grievance, how much time it took, and what you learned from managing the grievance process (maximum 500 words). If more than one grievance was addressed this reporting period, please explain the other grievance (s) here: